

برنامج  
الأغذية  
العالمي



Programme  
Alimentaire  
Mondial

World  
Food  
Programme

Programa  
Mundial  
de Alimentos

**Executive Board  
Second Regular Session**

**Rome, 16 - 18 May 2001**

## **EVALUATION REPORTS**

### **Agenda item 3**

***For consideration***

# **E**

Distribution: GENERAL

**WFP/EB.2/2001/3/3**

2 April 2001

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

## **SUMMARY REPORT OF THE MID-TERM EVALUATION OF COUNTRY PROGRAMME—INDIA (1997–2001)**

This document is printed in a limited number of copies. Executive Board documents are available on WFP's WEB site ([http://www.wfp.org/eb\\_public/EB\\_Home.html](http://www.wfp.org/eb_public/EB_Home.html)).

# Note to the Executive Board



**This document is submitted for consideration to the Executive Board.**

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document, to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, Office of Evaluation (OEDE): Mr A. Wilkinson tel.: 066513-2029

Evaluation Officer, OEDE: Ms M. Ahmed tel.: 066513-2223

Should you have any questions regarding matters of dispatch of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact the Supervisor, Meeting Servicing and Distribution Unit (tel.: 066513-2328).



# Executive Summary

Serious efforts were made to incorporate the new Country Programme (CP) approach in the preparation of the current India Country Programme, which was consolidated into three activities. These were reduced to two during programme implementation to allow for greater coherence and increased flexibility in resource use. The CP introduced changes in established areas of WFP activity, rather than identifying new target activities for intervention. This made sense, as the existing programme areas provided ample opportunities for the pursuit of CP objectives. Serious efforts were made to incorporate approaches reflecting evolving WFP policies in such areas as gender commitment, development impact (asset creation for poor families) and community participation and empowerment. As a result, 95 percent of the CP beneficiaries are among the most insecure women and children in India. The focus and the objectives of the CP are compatible with the Food Aid and Development (FAAD) policy. The CP performed well in responding to localized natural disasters through the acceleration of development activities.

In achieving desired outcomes WFP is dependent on its partners for engaging in local implementation, in particular, state-level government agencies, enhanced through partnership with other agencies, particularly non-governmental organizations (NGOs). Assisting partners in improving performance demands significant inputs of time in planning, advising and monitoring, either by WFP staff or by consultants. In addition, successful implementation of the CP will require more decentralization to the state level, and this is likely to require significant additions to the country office. Partnership with other funding agencies should result in complementary non-food resource availability.

## Draft Conclusion

The Board notes the recommendations contained in this evaluation report (WFP/EB.2/2001/3/3) and notes also the management action taken so far, as indicated in the associated information paper (WFP/EB.2/2001/INF/9). The Board encourages further action on these recommendations, taking into account considerations raised during the discussion.



---

## PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

1. The purpose of the mission was to evaluate the programme approach in terms of coherence, focus, integration and flexibility in order to provide recommendations for future Country Strategy Outlines (CSOs) and CPs, and accountability to the Executive Board. The evaluation focused primarily on the formulation and implementation of the CP as a whole.

---

## BACKGROUND AND RATIONALE FOR PROVIDING ASSISTANCE

### National Food Security

2. In aggregate terms, India's food supply is secure. Foodgrain production has grown more than the population. Since 1993, official foodgrain stocks have remained comfortably above "minimum buffer stock" levels, and recently stocks of 30–40 million MT have been around twice the minimum norm.

### Household Food Security

3. For several years India has faced the seeming paradox of widespread food insecurity and malnutrition amid rapidly increasing foodgrain production and well-stocked grain markets. There is a serious problem of food insecurity at the household level. India has the largest number of poor people and malnourished children in the world. More than 50 percent of children under 4 are malnourished in terms of weight-for-age, 30 percent of newborn children are significantly underweight and 60 percent of Indian women are anaemic. The current average daily per capita consumption of 2,150 kcal in rural areas, as compared with nationally set requirements of 2,400 kcal, is a sign of a significant food gap.
4. While there are several problems related to food utilization, the primary cause of food insecurity is a lack of access to food resulting from poverty. Chronic limited access to food results from low income, rooted in poor access to basic agricultural inputs, low farm incomes and few alternative sources of rural income. Transitory food insecurity results from seasonal fluctuations in food availability and access, and from natural disasters. Food insecurity affects mostly those with insufficient incomes to ensure a proper diet, insufficient assets or other mechanisms used for coping in times of severe food stress.

### National Food Security Priorities

5. Since independence in 1947, policymakers in India have given high priority to ensuring food security for the country's rising population. Foodgrain production has increased through technological innovations in agriculture. Food security has been supported by a comprehensive food management and distribution system and various safety net schemes, including massive public works programmes.



6. National food policy has included a programme of public food procurement that has provided an element of market stabilization by setting procurement prices and maintaining large public food stocks. Long-established government interventions in the supply of food to households include the Public Distribution System (PDS), which makes food available at subsidized prices through government stores; the Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS), which provides supplementary nutrition, and is supported by WFP; and the National Mid-day Meals Programme for primary-school children.
7. These efforts are in certain respects very ambitious; the PDS alone is estimated to absorb 0.5 percent of the gross domestic product (GDP). Nevertheless, they “have had relatively limited impact on nutrition among the poor because of major problems in effective targeting, implementation and coverage”.<sup>1</sup> More than 300 million people in India, or about one in three, are still food insecure despite these substantial government programmes.
8. The need for external food aid does not arise from national food shortages, but from the scarcity of fiscal resources to utilize available food stocks in public programmes and from deficiencies in instruments for public intervention.
9. Given the relative small size of WFP assistance (less than 0.06 percent of Official Development Assistance), the resources used must seek to have a disproportionate impact, by leveraging other resources in the chosen activity, providing a base for advocacy (e.g. of policy changes) and promoting innovative approaches to strategic problems.

---

## OVERVIEW OF THE COUNTRY PROGRAMME

10. The Executive Board approved the India CP in 1997 for a period of five years, to be extended to the end of 2002, in order to harmonize it with the planning cycle of the Government and of other United Nations agencies. The CP was developed on the basis of the CSO of December 1994 and received an allocation of US\$182 million for core activities. Provision was also made for supplementary activities valued at US\$68.8 million, depending on resource availability. The programme was intended to cover approximately 4 million beneficiaries.
11. The CP's objectives were to:
  - combat malnutrition and invest in human resources through ICDS;
  - help improve immediate food security for selected target groups and, with those groups' participation, invest generated funds in their sustainable food security;
  - maximize the active participation of women in WFP projects;
  - advocate and support joint forestry management (JFM);
  - help strengthen distribution channels for locally produced foodgrains; and
  - increase agricultural production and create employment through canal construction, command area development and settlement under irrigation schemes.

---

<sup>1</sup>Wasting Away—the Crisis of Malnutrition in India, World Bank, 1999, page 2.



12. The CP was planned to include three core development activities: (i) support to ICDS; (ii) improvement of food security in tribal areas through the Tribal Forestry Development Project (TFDP); and (iii) support for rural development through irrigation and settlement. Three supplementary activities were also planned. At present, only the first two core activities are operational, as the third activity was terminated in March 1998.

## ASSESSMENT, CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

### Concept and Design

13. WFP's support for the two activities in its current portfolio dates back more than 20 years. During that period, projects were subject to continual revisions and improvements as the policies of the Government and WFP changed. Nevertheless, the process that started with the 1994 CSO and led to the formulation of the first CP for India in 1997 was useful, and introduced some major evolutionary changes in WFP's activities in the country. Significant efforts were also made to incorporate current WFP policies.
14. Overall, the CP process in India led to more strategic programming, in line with WFP guidelines and policies. In general, the CP exhibits the desired characteristics of:
- **Integration.** The India CP is well integrated with the priorities of India's Union Government and the various state governments, as well as with those of the United Nations system and other donors. ICDS is one of the Indian Government's main social programmes for addressing malnutrition and micronutrient deficiencies among children and young mothers. It remains prominent as a component of the Government's policy on national health and nutrition as reflected in the country's National Plan of Action for Nutrition and the commitments expressed in international policy fora. WFP has been a principal donor to the Government's ICDS programme since 1976, together with CARE, UNICEF, USAID and the World Bank. The TFDP's long-standing support for JFM, a policy introduced in the early 1990s, makes it an important part of India's current policy agenda for the environment. Activities are also supported by the International Fund for Agricultural Development (IFAD), the Department for International Development (DFID), and the World Bank.
  - **Coherence.** The main goals and objectives of the India CP are simple, conceptually sound and coherent. The two CP activities are complementary, addressing different aspects of improved household food security and nutrition. ICDS provides supplementary nutrition and services for children under 6 and expectant and nursing mothers, while TFDP is more concerned with overall household food security. The common thread of both activities is their attention to women and their investment in human and social resources.
  - **Focus.** Not only has the CP increasingly focused on the most disadvantaged districts, villages and beneficiaries, it has also concentrated its resources on two key government implementing agencies, the Department for Women and Child Development (DWCD) and the Forestry Department, with the objective of supporting institutional and behavioural change in those departments.
  - **Flexibility.** The CP has proven to be flexible and innovative by shifting food resources to better-performing states and integrated pilot activities and by accelerating activities to respond to natural disasters. It has also mobilized significant non-food resources for the testing of new models.



15. The CP has not been very successful in bringing greater convergence between ICDS and TFDP, a recently stated objective of the India CP. However, some positive experiments in convergence were initiated in pilot districts and a number of ICDS *anganwadi* centres (AWCs) have been built with the assistance of generated funds from the TFDP. The main constraint on convergence is that the two CP activities overlap in only very few districts, mostly in Rajasthan and Western Madhya Pradesh (M.P.). In many districts and villages served by TFDP, either CARE supports ICDS activities or villages may not qualify at all for ICDS assistance, as their population density is too low to conform to national ICDS regulations.

## Operation and Implementation

### 📌 *Integrated Child Development Services*

16. ICDS has been in operation since 1975. It is designed to provide basic health, nutrition and education to poor women and children through village-level *anganwadi* centres. The programme is the first and the largest such government-supported child development programme in the world.
17. ICDS seeks to improve household food security by: (i) providing a high-quality food supplement to particularly vulnerable young children and expectant and nursing mothers; and (ii) investing in pre-school education, mothers' nutrition education, maternal child care and improved quality in and access to health services.
18. WFP has supported the programme in six states: Assam, Kerala, Madhya Pradesh, Orissa, Rajasthan and Uttar Pradesh (U.P.). Its beneficiaries number an estimated 2.6 million, spread across 42,000 AWCs in some 47 districts. The programme provides supplementary feeding for about 25 days a month to children under 6 and expectant and nursing mothers through on-site feedings and take-home rations.
19. The immediate positive impact of providing take-home rations to families with severely malnourished children and of feeding children with the WFP- and ICDS-developed food supplement Indiamix, a micronutrient-fortified blended food, is a significant contribution of the programme. Food supplementation is intended to attract children and women to the AWCs for education, women's empowerment and community development, a challenging task that goes well beyond the provision of food to the needy.
20. Progress has not been easy. The *anganwadi* workers (AWWs) have difficulties in identifying vulnerable families, so they assume that all families will benefit equally from the supplement. Producing tighter targeting (concentrating on children under 3) could reduce beneficiary numbers and thus reduce pressure on AWWs to provide food and services. Such tighter targeting can be enhanced by refocusing the CP into fewer high-priority areas and decentralizing the WFP country office.
21. A strong focus on identifying and supporting the most effective coping strategies for communities and households most at risk and for creating sustainability would require work at the community level, and in particular community participation and a sense of ownership. Therefore, cooperation with NGOs is crucial to ICDS success.
22. The success of the WFP programme with ICDS depends on the institutional and personal relationships and ownership engendered through the AWC staff. When good field support is available, a sense of purpose and direction results. But without strong partner support in critical areas (adolescent programmes, empowerment, improved targeting and monitoring, improved training), it is unlikely that CP objectives can be achieved. Contracts



with partners may need revision in order that they focus more clearly on those elements of ICDS that may be practically achieved with WFP support.

23. Numerous evaluations and reviews of ICDS have taken place over many years. Follow-up to recent reports should identify the barriers to undertaking the suggested changes. The mission did not seek to repeat the well-documented critiques of ICDS but rather concentrated on the process undertaken by WFP in attempting to respond to deficiencies and opportunities in a manner that reflected the overall CP approach.
24. The key contributions of WFP to ICDS have been the development of the fortified food supplement, Indiamix, and work on a food-based approach to addressing micronutrient deficiencies. However, there is a potential negative effect if the supplement is perceived as the essential element in child feeding rather than as complementary to a balanced diet from local food. Therefore, provision of the supplement should be accompanied by strong information, education and communication (IEC) support, as has been initiated in a limited number of places.
25. **The donor role in ICDS.** The World Bank, CARE and UNICEF also recognize the need for institutional change to address the deep-seated problems involved in ICDS, but they face an uphill task in reorienting a top-down government process and preparing the AWWs to facilitate social change and communicate practical messages. However, in the long-term, current decentralization pushes by donors and the Government may result in significant positive changes.
26. The most important contributions by WFP might be to raise policymakers' awareness, particularly at the state level, of the need to invest in early childhood nutrition, and to assist in improving implementation based on the Programme's regional and worldwide experiences.

### Recommendations

⇒ WFP is advised to:

- ✍ continue to work with donors and NGO partners in improving the design and implementation of ICDS, since many donors already acknowledge the need for a combined reassessment of the donor focus; and
- ✍ refocus the CP into fewer high-priority areas, which, along with country office decentralization, should help create tighter targeting; and agree upon specific monitoring indicators for each programme district with reference to vulnerability analysis and mapping (VAM)–generated data and the supporting qualitative information developed with relevant communities.

27. Specific issues that warrant further attention by WFP and partners include: capacity-building of AWWs and supervisors; the development of IEC and behavioural change processes; institutional support (especially for Panchayati Raj institutions and their women members); and a change in emphasis to concentrate supplementary feeding on children under 3 progressively over the next two years.

### ⇒ **Improvement of Food Security in Tribal Areas through the Tribal Forestry Development Project**

28. The second core activity focuses on the food security of scheduled tribal people and castes in degraded forest areas in six states. TFDP accounts for around 45 percent of the India CP.





29. WFP's assistance to forest projects started in 1972 in Maharashtra, primarily to support forest departments in managing forests and to provide some short-term relief for local tribal people. Project objectives and strategic approaches changed in the early 1990s when India introduced social forestry principles under its new JFM policy. While forest protection and reforestation remained a primary goal, participatory planning through JFM and forest protection committees was introduced.
30. To support this process, the TFDP offered: (i) food rations as a subsidized supplement to wages received for seasonal employment in Forestry Department activities, and (ii) productive investments supported by cash generated through a deduction from the Forestry Department wage bill (funded under state budgets). These funds are redistributed to selected communities for use in ways agreed upon by those communities, districts, state officials and WFP.
31. In the formulation of the CP in 1997, significant modifications were introduced to the TFDP. Project activities became less geographically dispersed, and projects in five of the six states were consolidated into one project (No. 5569).<sup>2</sup> This led to a more unified approach, e.g. in the distribution and management of generated funds through village micro-plans. It also resulted in more flexibility in resource allocation among states, by permitting the reallocation of resources to better-performing states. Pilot activities were also initiated in two districts to explore the potential for achieving greater synergy between TFDP and ICDS.
32. **Support of employment-generation for short-term food security.** Food rations provided to daily wage workers in forest department activities increase incomes and access to food (as the food is priced at a concessional rate). Real wages are increased by subsidized food rations (valued between 15 and 25 percent of cash wages). Supplementary income, in the form of oil, pulses and rice or wheat, is appropriate because of the poor availability and quality of food in many remote areas.
33. The total number of beneficiaries is estimated at slightly more than 600,000 people from about 121,650 poor families. The aggregate implementation targets set by the operational contract in terms of food distribution to forest workers have largely been met. There are, however, significant differences among states, with Gujarat, M.P. and Orissa, either exceeding or coming close to targets, and Bihar, Rajasthan and U.P. achieving between 50 and 65 percent.
34. While the numbers are encouraging, last year's government audits identified several issues that suggested that food has not always been distributed according to agreements. One concern is that the targeted number of employment days and food rations per beneficiary worker (105) is rarely achieved. The amount of work, and thus the food rations received, often depends on the potential for timber and bamboo harvesting (forest density). There are also pressures to employ a large number of labourers during the short forestry season. Self-targeting works to some extent, but people who are not necessarily the neediest are also attracted by the employment opportunities.
35. **Utilization of generated funds.** The forest departments save cash from the wage bill, which generates funds to be invested in village development activities that cannot easily be supported with direct food assistance (a total of about US\$15 million over a five-year CP period). Before initiation of the current CP, only two out of six states used village micro-planning based on community participation. As of September 2000, 161 new micro-plans

---

<sup>2</sup>The Gujarat project remained separate, as continued involvement in the state was uncertain.



out of the 439 planned had been formulated, most of which are expected to be approved by state-level committees this year.

36. With the introduction of micro-plans and increased community participation, irrigation and water-management facilities are demanding an increasing share of available funds. However, villagers do not benefit equally from irrigation investments, which are often biased towards the lands of the better-off and influential farmers. Ensuring access to irrigation benefits for poorer community members remains an important issue for equitable development.
37. Forestry activities that rehabilitate, protect and create forests also potentially benefit long-term food security. Profits from harvesting are intended to flow back into local communities under JFM's revenue-sharing arrangements (30–80 percent). However, sharing and harvesting arrangements need to be clearly spelled out, and understood by the Forestry Department and the communities.
38. Complementary income-generating activities in and outside of agriculture need to be expanded, particularly for women. Such activities should be targeted to those households and community groups least able to benefit from gains in irrigated farm production. However, activities should be started only when they can be accompanied by appropriate support structures that will provide training, technical, management, marketing advice and credit and savings facilities.
39. **Village selection.** The main indicators for the 439 villages selected for micro-plans were high food insecurity, a high concentration of landless people, out-migration and the villages' remoteness. Social indicators included the communities' willingness to contribute to the implementation of activities and the availability of JFM committees and local NGOs or other village development groups.
40. In four out of six states, the identification of micro-plan villages was contracted out to external research and consulting institutions. The Forestry Department had some differences with these outside agencies' selection of villages. In particular, the Department saw some selected villages as being inappropriate in terms of villager motivation and commitment to forest protection and the availability of adequate Forestry Department services in the area. Furthermore, many villages with exemplary forest protection were bypassed, which generated disappointment.



41. Notwithstanding the merits of the micro-plan approach, cluster approaches may be more advantageous for achieving the desired multiplier and replication results. NGOs working in the micro-credit field suggest that it is better not to single out individual villages in order to: (i) prevent other villages from feeling envious, unfairly treated or neglected; and (ii) generate a larger critical mass and support for specific interventions.

### Recommendations

☞ The country office is advised to:

- ✍ improve monitoring of the Forestry Department's employment-generation and beneficiary targeting, to address concerns raised by government auditors in 1999 and ensure proper beneficiary targeting and forest revenue sharing, which will require employing more WFP food aid monitors;
- ✍ review revenue-sharing arrangements from short-term employment-generation, in order to ensure that benefits reach WFP's target groups in line with FAAD principles;
- ✍ ensure the continuing availability of counterpart funds, and explore with other partners alternative mechanisms to close-circuit monetization or the direct utilization of food in micro-plan-related activities;
- ✍ review and monitor the intra-community distribution of benefits, to identify and target specific disadvantaged groups with special programmes to ensure fair access by all community members to benefits from irrigation and forest investments;
- ✍ improve the assessment of the economic feasibility of investments, and of the underlying socio-economic problems and solutions, and make provisions for long-term maintenance and running costs (e.g. marketing, social structures); and
- ✍ reconsider the current distribution of generated fund resources to villages of high concentration (80 percent) and sectoral support initiatives (10–16 percent) and explore the merits of cluster approaches in geographic targeting.

## Common Country Programme Issues

### ☞ Gender

42. In many respects, the gender focus is one of the most positive features of the India CP:

- Gender has been integrated into the CP, and in the design of its activities. Gender concerns have been included in planning, monitoring, evaluating and reporting. Gender-disaggregated data are included in all operational contracts with other partners.
- A Gender Action Plan was developed and is reviewed biannually. Gender training courses are offered to counterpart staff.
- Women and children constitute 100 percent of the beneficiaries of the ICDS activity and 80 percent of the beneficiaries of the TFDP activity. Therefore, 95 percent of the CP beneficiaries are women and children.



- The CP addresses the micronutrient deficiencies of vulnerable groups of women, children and adolescents by: (i) providing fortified food in all activities; (ii) encouraging local production of fortified food (Indiamix); and (iii) working with the Government to include micronutrient-fortification norms in all supplementary food to ICDS.
  - The WFP-supported TFDP, through CARE and associated local NGOs, has supported the establishment of savings and credit groups, which expand women's access to credit.
  - The country office has supported the recruitment of two female social development officers from the generated funds in the joint forestry management component.
43. There have been significant developments in the country office in relation to gender concerns, and a pro-woman focus was strongly reflected in discussions with country office staff. The number of women staff increased from 32 percent in 1996 to 43 percent in 2000. Based on the above, and on an assessment of the CP's adherence to WFP's Commitments to Women, the India CP's performance was found to be fully satisfactory and commendable.
44. Although 55 percent of the CP participants (as distinct from beneficiaries) are women and girls, achievements in promoting gender equality cannot be seen solely in terms of the *numbers* of women involved in various activities. The critical dimension is the quality of change: in women's actual control over the resources acquired or accessed, and in their role within their families and the community. While it is hoped that women's position in the family is being strengthened through their increased contribution to household food needs, progress with respect to their participation in decision-making or their control of resources appears slow. Although women's committees exist in most project villages, their effectiveness in involving women actively in the decision-making process is poor, as women's participation is limited, in most cases, to silent attendance.
45. While it is valuable to tip the scales in favour of women, in order to achieve a sustainable change in women's status, men have to be brought into the process. Direct empowerment of women needs to be complemented by addressing the concerns of husbands, sons and fathers. Most reports acknowledge that the process of change will be slow unless men see an advantage for themselves in empowering women and involving them fully in development options.

### Recommendations

- ☞ The country office is advised to:
  - ✍ support and encourage the Government in recruiting more female social development officers in the joint forestry management component for micro-plan formulation and implementation.
- ☞ WFP is advised to:
  - ✍ review its current approach to gender issues in favour of a more comprehensive approach that aims to increase women's access to and control over resources on equal terms with men.

### ☞ **Participatory Decision-making**

46. Increased participation by villagers, particularly women, and the decentralization of decision-making to the village and *panchayat* levels are key goals of the India CP. These



are challenging and arduous tasks, involving the building of trust and changes in power relationships and requiring intensive grass-roots work by sensitive and well-trained staff.

47. In JFM, some progress has been made, particularly in encouraging active participation in the micro-plan process at the village level, and by supporting the development of models for women's self-help groups (micro-credit) and long-term agricultural training and extension support through NGOs (e.g. in Bihar). The further development of village-level partnerships will require a greater WFP presence at the district level, continued work with the forestry departments to adjust the profile of forestry staff and identification of additional appropriate NGO partners.
48. There is less scope for broad community participation within ICDS since it is a long-standing programme following established government practices. It is assumed that women's groups can provide an important avenue for facilitating participatory processes. However, evidence was found that women's groups have not yet developed into effective self-help groups. There must be a shift from providing a forum for women's formal participation and representation to allowing for their genuine empowerment for the benefit of all community members.
49. The recent intensive pilot initiatives in a few districts offer an opportunity for expanding participation to a more active process, with involvement from local government members at the ward, block and district levels, and from community groups with relevant interests (e.g. women's microenterprises).

### **Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping**

50. One potentially important contribution of WFP to food security policy in India is the development and application of VAM methods. Food vulnerability at the household level has been modelled by WFP. The application of the model shows that there is a significant role for VAM in assisting in and improving targeting for specific districts/blocks.

### **Monitoring**

51. There have been several positive developments in monitoring the outcomes, overall effects and ultimate impacts of the CP activities. The CP document provides a focused although somewhat generic list of key indicators. The operational contracts for ICDS and TFDP incorporate monitoring and evaluation (M&E) in general, and impact monitoring in particular. Gender-specific beneficiary monitoring and reporting are promoted in both the CP's activities. Village baseline studies have been conducted. Also, several WFP food aid monitors were hired in 1999 on short-term contracts to complement the monitoring capacity of the implementing agencies.
52. As progress in monitoring is made, several issues begin to crystallize. Past efforts to improve the India CP monitoring system were characterized by an abundance of proposals, some of them highly complex and sophisticated. Although awareness of the importance of monitoring and impact assessments has increased, monitoring plans have often been overambitious, with their requirements outstripping the capacity of those implementing them and their costs surpassing the limited funds available for them. WFP's current M&E capacities are not yet adequate, either in the country office or in the field. The capacity of WFP's implementing partners reliably to monitor the activities in terms of anything more than their basic inputs and outputs is questionable. Monitoring needs to be driven by more clearly defined management priorities for information needs, and achievable with the resources available.



53. Furthermore, since WFP has no formal regular reporting requirement for a CP as a whole, apart from the evaluation report at mid-term, there is no standardized data collection, analysis or monitoring across activities in the India CP.

#### Recommendations

- ☞ The country office is advised to:
  - ✍ review monitoring priorities by analysing the CP's basic objectives and its multiple constraints on monitoring, and by realistically assessing what can be done by WFP and its partners (which will require prioritizing information requirements and concentrating on the aspects of CP inputs, outputs and outcomes that are measurable and that should be regularly and publicly reported on); and
  - ✍ assist implementing partners in improving their in-house monitoring capacities and systems.
- ☞ WFP is advised to:
  - ✍ strengthen the CP approach by establishing a monitoring and reporting requirement for the CP as a whole (e.g. an annual summary report).

#### ☞ Staffing

54. Country office staff numbers have remained static and have not been affected by the creation of the CP. Staff seem to have the right combination of profile and skills required to design, manage and implement the CP, but not to undertake effective monitoring. This deficiency has been addressed by the recruitment of six food monitors on short-term contracts funded from the M&E fund.
55. In order to bring WFP support closer to the implementation sites, the country office is implementing a decentralization plan. One sub-office has been created, with another two to follow. However, the proposed structure, based on the deployment of existing posts from the New Delhi office to the field, does not address the shortage of food monitors. This is largely attributable to the constraint imposed by the DSC budget, where the support cost depends on the amount of food moved.

#### Recommendation

- ☞ WFP is advised to:
  - ✍ review and adjust the typical country office staffing profiles and deployment for countries that manage CPs. Staff profiles should be appropriate for carrying out management, implementation and monitoring tasks.

#### ☞ Response to Natural Disasters

56. The India CP does not include any explicit contingency planning for disaster mitigation. Nevertheless, when disasters have struck (floods in Assam, drought in Rajasthan and a major cyclone in Orissa), WFP has reacted quickly, mostly upon state governments' requests. Its main instrument in such cases is the acceleration of the delivery of planned CP resources for ICDS and TFDP for a particular state, and the reallocation and concentration of those resources on the geographic areas most affected. However, such assistance has been provided for natural disasters only in those states where WFP already has a presence.





57. In sum, the India CP mechanism did permit the necessary shifts of food resources in a timely and efficient way. WFP's presence, technical know-how, staff dedication and collaboration within an efficient United Nations-coordinated response facilitated assistance. The United Nations response to the Orissa cyclone in 1999 is now seen as a model for United Nations coordination in programming and implementation.

---

## COMPATIBILITY WITH ENABLING DEVELOPMENT POLICY

58. The country office undertook a mid-term policy review in November/December 1999 to assess the India CP for its compatibility with the principles of the Enabling Development policy. The review concluded that the focus and objectives of the current CP were basically consistent with FAAD policy. However, the review also pointed out that the development impact of these interventions has been limited by the absence of complementary inputs. This evaluation agrees with those findings and the conclusion of the review with regard to FAAD.

---

## FUTURE SCOPE OF THE COUNTRY PROGRAMME

59. The evaluation mission is in broad agreement with the mid-term policy review in many of its main conclusions. The current Country Programme is spread too thin, and there should be a move in the direction of greater geographical concentration, both in fewer states and in fewer districts within the chosen states. The choice of target states from among the populous poorer northern states is appropriate.
60. The first draft CSO document placed a good deal of emphasis on achieving synergy among the various WFP interventions. While this approach should generate benefits, the fundamental problem WFP faces is the rather limited range of *inputs* it has on offer. Complementary inputs are required to increase the productivity of WFP food inputs. This, in turn, requires careful identification of the partners that can most effectively complement WFP resources, which could include NGOs, United Nations and non-United Nations donor agencies and government agencies. In this regard, the critical synergy that WFP now needs to seek out is that with partners agencies, in addition to that among its own activities.



---

## LIST OF ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

AWC	<i>Anganwadi</i> centre
AWW	<i>Anganwadi</i> worker
CARE	Cooperative for Assistance and Relief Everywhere
CP	Country Programme
CSO	Country Strategy Outline
DFID	Department for International Development
DWCD	Department for Women and Child Development
FAAD	Food Aid and Development
GDP	Gross domestic product
ICDS	Integrated Child Development Services
IEC	Information, education and communication
IFAD	International Fund for Agricultural Development
JFM	Joint Forestry Management
M&E	Monitoring and evaluation
NGO	Non-governmental organization
PDS	Public Distribution System
TFDP	Tribal Forestry Development Project
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VAM	Vulnerability analysis and mapping

