

برنامج
الأغذية
العالمي



Programme
Alimentaire
Mondial

World
Food
Programme

Programa
Mundial
de Alimentos

**Executive Board
Third Regular Session**

Rome, 11–14 October 2004

EVALUATION REPORTS

Agenda item 6

For consideration



Distribution: GENERAL
WFP/EB.3/2004/6-D
30 August 2004
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

SUMMARY EVALUATION REPORT ON WFP'S PORTFOLIO OF ACTIVITIES IN RWANDA

This document is printed in a limited number of copies. Executive Board documents are available on WFP's WEB site (<http://www.wfp.org/eb>).

NOTE TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

This document is submitted for consideration to the Executive Board.

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, Office of Evaluation (OEDE): Mr K. Tuinenburg tel.: 066513-2252

Senior Evaluation Officer, OEDE: Ms A. Waeschle tel.: 066513-2026

Should you have any questions regarding matters of dispatch of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact the Supervisor, Meeting Servicing and Distribution Unit (tel.: 066513-2328).



EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The evaluation took a retrospective view of WFP's portfolio of activities between 1999 and 2003, in particular the emergency–recovery–development linkages. It found that the built-in flexibility of the Great Lakes regional protracted relief and recovery operations facilitated the shift from emergency relief to recovery activities. With the human resources and infrastructure of the regional operations in place, WFP was able rapidly to adjust programming and training of national and international staff. The shift from general to targeted food distributions under the recovery component, mainly food-for-asset activities, was one of the best initiatives of the country office and the Government in favour of affected populations who had no other means of sustaining themselves. It minimized the risk of perpetuating dependency on emergency relief distributions while paving the way for sustainable development; it also helped to rebuild the confidence of a population that had suffered war and genocide.

All achievements seen by the mission in the fields of food for asset creation and human resource development were of good quality and relevant to the needs of the population and the country. With regard to nutrition, lack of baseline data made it difficult to measure and quantify results, but for reasons given later in the report, the relatively stable number of beneficiaries in nutrition centres suggested that malnutrition rates in 2004 regrettably remained unacceptably high in many parts of the country.

Considering that the transition process is not yet completed, the mission supported the continuation of recovery and nutrition activities under the regional operation, in addition to general distributions to returnees and refugees. It also supported the choice of the two human–resource development activities included in the forthcoming country programme for 2003–2006. These represent overriding priorities in the Government's Poverty-Reduction Strategy Paper and two of WFP's five Strategic Priorities: (i) to enable poor households to invest in human capital through education and training, and (ii) to enable poor families to gain and preserve assets.

DRAFT DECISION*

The Board takes note of the information and recommendations contained in the Summary Evaluation Report on WFP's Portfolio of Activities in Rwanda (WFP/EB.3/2004/6-D).

* This is a draft decision. For the final decision adopted by the Board, please refer to the Decisions and Recommendations document issued at the end of the session.



INTRODUCTION TO THE EVALUATION¹

1. The present evaluation covered the post-emergency period between 1999 and 2003. Its principal objectives were to:
 - assess the efficiency, effectiveness, impact, sustainability and relevance of WFP's portfolio of activities over time in the light of the country's socio-political and economic situation;
 - make recommendations that would be relevant to the current portfolio of activities in terms of coherence and synergies, as well as of operational improvements of individual activities; and
 - draw lessons for use in future programmes.
2. Particular attention was devoted to the appropriateness and timeliness of WFP's short-term and longer-term response, including timely and adequate provision of food and cash resources and the adequacy of WFP's in-country management structures and profiles for effective handling of recovery and development activities, as well as the efficiency and effectiveness of beneficiary targeting as the situation evolved.

BACKGROUND AND OVERVIEW OF WFP'S RESPONSE

3. Rwanda is a least-developed country with a per capita gross national income in 2002 of US\$230 and one of the highest population densities in Africa, averaging 305 people per km², or 746 people per km² of arable land; 90 percent of the population live in rural areas of whom 40 percent are reported to be landless. In spite of important recovery and development programmes since the end of the civil war, Rwanda still ranks 158th out of 175 countries in the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP) Human Development Report for 2003.
4. The 1994 genocide and ensuing war, in which about 1 million people lost their lives, had catastrophic effects on Rwanda's human resource base, institutional capacity and economic and social infrastructure. It resulted in massive population displacement and large populations of food-insecure people and exacerbated long-standing development problems such as food insecurity, which results from inadequate production, high population density, insufficient arable land, over-reliance on agriculture, land degradation, adverse weather conditions, undeveloped commodity trade and weak agricultural support services. In recent years, poverty and food insecurity have increased, especially in drought-prone areas; children and households headed by women were the worst affected. According to the 2001 Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper (PRSP), 64.1 percent of households were below the poverty line in 2000 compared with 47.5 percent in 1990.
5. In response to these challenges, WFP has since 1992 implemented various emergency operations to provide life-saving food to people in need. The most important operation was regional emergency operation (EMOP) 5624 "Food Assistance to the Great Lakes Region" from 1995 to 1999, covering Burundi, Rwanda, Tanzania and Uganda. The cost of the Rwanda operation was US\$586.8 million, benefiting 3 million people in Rwanda and neighbouring countries.

¹ The mission comprised an emergency and development expert as team leader, an international nutrition and public health expert and a rural development expert. A senior evaluation officer from WFP Headquarters joined the team for the last week in Kigali.



6. Three other regional protracted relief and recovery operations (PRROs) were subsequently approved at a cost for Rwanda of US\$154.4 million; the current operation is scheduled to end in 2006. Three quick-action projects (QAPs) and pilot development projects, one EMOP and one special operation (SO) have been approved and implemented in Rwanda at a cost of US\$19.8 million:
 - QAP RWA 6096 “Enhanced Food Security through Swamp and Hillside Reclamation and Development”, 1999–2003;
 - EMOP 6318 “Drought in the Southeast”, 2000–2002;
 - SO 10169.0 “Logistic Support to the Inter-Agency Relief Effort to Assist those Populations Affected by the Volcanic Eruption in Goma”, 2002;
 - Development Project RWA 10076.0 “Support to Primary Education in Food-Insecure Regions of Rwanda”, 2002–2004;
 - Development Project RWA 10079.0 “Support to Improved Self-Reliance to HIV/AIDS-Affected Households”, 2002–2004.
7. As of August 1999, WFP’s focus of intervention shifted towards recovery activities with a view to helping to reinsert vulnerable groups into economic and social life, a major concern in the years following the genocide, while steadily reducing general food distributions. Priority was given to food-for-assets (FFA) activities aimed at improving household food security and nutrition.
8. The country programme for 2003–2006, starting in August 2004, includes school feeding and HIV/AIDS activities, currently undertaken under two pilot projects that were extended until July 2004. They represent overriding priorities in the Government’s PRSP and WFP’s development policy. The country programme will be implemented in tandem with regional PRRO 10062.01, operational until December 2006, under which food aid will continue to be provided for refugees and returnees, reintegration of demobilized military personnel and FFA and nutrition activities. In the light of its findings, the mission fully supported this approach. The mission recommended that FFA and mother-and-child health (MCH) activities should become an integral part of the country programme if the PRRO were terminated.
9. During the period covered by the evaluation, 169,804 mt of food was distributed at an estimated cost of US\$140 million. The number of beneficiaries by year and by type of intervention is given in the following table.



NUMBER OF BENEFICIARIES UNDER WFP'S PORTFOLIO OF ACTIVITIES								
Year	Refugees/ returnees	Relief/ nutrition	Recovery/ FFW	Drought	Others*	School feeding	HIV/ AIDS	Total
1999								
PRRO 6077	71 240	52 885	54 965	220 000	76 570	-	-	475 660
QAP 6096	-	-	18 138	-	-	-	-	18 138
Total								493 798
2000								
PRRO 6077	24 299	20 858	75 000	253 407	16 300	-	-	389 864
EMOP 6318	-	-	-	253 907	-	-	-	253 907
QAP 6096	-	-	44 815	-	-	-	-	44 815
Total								688 586
2001								
PRRO 6077/ 10062.0	21 559	13 950	78 195	83 500	15 885	-	-	213 089
EMOP 6318	-	-	9 719	40 887	-	-	-	50 606
QAP 6096	-	-	3 960	-	-	-	-	3 960
Total								267 655
2002								
PRRO 10062.0	38 145	21 228	66 954	-	13 859	-	-	140 186
DEV 10076	-	-	-	-	-	176 101	-	176 101
DEV 10079	-	-	-	-	-	-	53 280	53 280
QAP 6096	-	-	8 423	-	-	-	-	8 423
Total								377 990
2003								
PRRO 10062.0	22 600	20 400	49 438	-	27 472	-	-	119 910
DEV 10076	-	-	-	-	-	201 763	-	201 763
DEV 10079	-	-	-	-	-	-	86 835	86 835
QAP 6096	-	-	21 880	-	-	-	-	21 880
Total								430 388

*Others: Food for training (FFT), demobilized soldiers, prisoners (limited period only), institutional feeding.



STRATEGY AND DESIGN ISSUES

Assessment and Targeting

10. Assistance provided under regional EMOP 5624 focused on all population groups affected by the civil conflict – refugees, returnees and internally displaced people (IDPs) – as well as on individuals requiring nutritional support and rehabilitation.
11. Returnees received a three-month repatriation package prior to being reintegrated into their communities of origin, where they would then benefit from FFA programmes. Survivors of the genocide, particularly widows and orphans, also received WFP food rations. The decision to target all vulnerable groups under various programmes helped to reduce social tensions.
12. The first vulnerability analysis and mapping (VAM) exercise took place in 2001 and helped to improve emergency relief and recovery efforts to meet identified needs in an effective and sustainable way. Geographical and beneficiary targeting were constantly refined with the help of VAM and other food-security data from the Famine Early-Warning System Network (FEWS/NET) and the European Union, and household food economy assessments by Save the Children.

Recovery and Development Activities

13. The built-in flexibility of the regional PRROs allowed food to be shifted easily from relief to recovery activities and vice-versa as well as from one country to another. Changing priorities were thus easily and rapidly met without major bureaucracy and loss of time.
14. WFP and the Government prioritized a steady shift from emergency to recovery and development activities with a view to paving the way for sustainable development and reducing the risk of dependency on general food distributions, favouring whenever and wherever possible FFA or food-for-training (FFT) recovery activities aimed at the rehabilitation of agriculture, basic infrastructure and housing, and development of human resources.
15. The design of the QAP for swamp-land rehabilitation in 1998 was guided by the experience of the regional PRROs under which the activity started. Guidelines for the formulation of this project and those for establishing FFA management committees or associations were used in 2001 for the design and implementation of the WFP-supported HIV/AIDS pilot development project.

IMPLEMENTATION OF ONGOING ACTIVITIES

Relief

⇒ *Refugees and returnees*

16. WFP has been assuming responsibility for food distribution in all refugee camps in Rwanda since June 2003, in line with the new Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR)/WFP memorandum of understanding. According to representatives of UNHCR and WFP Rwanda, the new system was working efficiently.



17. During 2003, 31,000 refugees in three camps received WFP food rations. Continued instability in eastern Democratic Republic of Congo, from where most of the refugees originate, hampered prospects for voluntary repatriation.
18. During a visit to a small camp in Kigeme (Gikongoro), the mission noted that necessary measures and infrastructure were in place. No complaints were received regarding food assistance.
19. In 2003, 22,600 Rwandan returnees were repatriated; the current remaining caseload is estimated at 40,000 people.

⇒ *Nutrition*

20. Nearly 24 percent of children were underweight, 5 percent severely, indicating only slight improvements in nutritional status over the past decade. The overall infant mortality rate was 122 per 1,000 live births; under-5 mortality was 196 per 1,000 live births.
21. The absence of baseline nutrition information from the general population in areas targeted by WFP prevented WFP and its partners from estimating target populations for selective feeding programmes and from assessing the effectiveness of nutrition-related activities.
22. The mission noted that significant improvements in nutritional status had not taken place between 1996 and 2000, despite major assistance from WFP and other partners. Widespread food insecurity remained the main cause of malnutrition. Repeated crop failures, mainly the result of droughts, exacerbated the negative effects of widespread poverty.

⇒ *Micronutrients*

23. Regarding the prevalence of iron-deficiency anemia, only 17 percent of women who had given birth in the five previous years had taken iron supplements, and for less than three months.
24. Anaemia rates of over 50 percent among children and up to 29 percent vitamin-A deficiency among pre-school children indicated the potential seriousness of micronutrient deficiencies. Only 14 percent of women who had given birth in the previous five years had received a high-dose vitamin-A supplement immediately following the birth of a child.
25. The WFP country office provided iodized salt, though iodized salt testing kits were not available or used routinely, vegetable oil fortified with vitamin A and vitamin D, and blended foods fortified with vitamins and minerals to address these micronutrient deficiencies.
26. In addition to WFP's policy on iodized salt, government legislation required all imported salt to be iodized. The mission was informed that 90 percent of the households tested consumed adequately iodized salt.

⇒ *Supplementary and therapeutic feeding*

27. Under the regional PRROs, WFP has been providing food for the supplementary feeding programmes (SFPs) and therapeutic feeding programmes (TFPs), with direct responsibility for SFP. The United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF) provided therapeutic milk and technical supervision to implementing partners in support of TFPs.



28. Feeding centres used wasting measured as weight-for-age as the criterion for admission. WFP changed the admission indicator to weight-for-height in 1999 to reduce the number of beneficiaries and “to address severe malnutrition”.
29. In 2000, WFP adjusted SFP targets from children under 5 to children under 3 and all pregnant and lactating mothers, and focused on MCH. TFPs included all severely malnourished children in the same age group.
30. Without baseline nutrition data and periodic nutrition surveys of the general population, the mission could not obtain a clear estimate of the number of malnourished people requiring nutrition assistance; it was therefore impossible to determine the extent to which feeding programmes achieved sufficient coverage of intended beneficiaries.
31. WFP-supported nutrition centres provided complementary activities in addition to food for SFP and TFP beneficiaries and caregivers, including nutrition and health education, food demonstrations and activities aimed at increasing beneficiaries’ access to food.
32. Other challenges to achieving nutrition objectives included differing cultural beliefs among beneficiaries and nutrition centre staff with regard to nutrition, health, infant feeding and care practices; there were few women in project management and a low level of involvement among fathers.
33. WFP’s policy was gradually to increase the Government’s involvement in feeding programmes, but nutrition centres that did not benefit from the financial and technical support of a non-governmental organization (NGO) had limited staff technical capacity and resources.
34. Between 1999 and 2003, the number of nutrition centres was reduced from 252 to 93. An evaluation in 2002 concluded that without adequate general rations for food-insecure populations, SFPs would have minimal impact on reducing malnutrition, and that WFP’s assistance should be integrated with community health services to facilitate referral and treatment of individuals with medical problems.

RECOVERY AND DEVELOPMENT

FFA Activities

35. FFA in food-insecure areas constituted the bulk of recovery activities, focusing on agricultural production as the basis for achieving long-term development in Rwanda. FFA programmes included swamp reclamation, soil conservation, food production, rural forestation, seed multiplication and school gardens.
36. The mission considered that FFA was an appropriate strategy for the agricultural sector, considering that (i) many activities were labour-intensive, using local technology that required minimal non-food resources, (ii) it was instrumental in countering future food-security problems while providing short-term assistance to populations in need, and (iii) it produced longer-term benefits.
37. **Swamp reclamation** reflected a major orientation of the National Strategy for Agriculture and remained the largest intervention supported by food aid. Over the past five years, 11,466 ha have been rehabilitated, 15 percent of cultivated swamps. Reclaimed land was distributed to project workers or managed by farmers’ associations.



38. Reclaimed swamp areas are fertile, productive and suitable for rice production, provided the necessary information, technologies and skills are available; it is possible to harvest two rice crops per year. In the Bugesera area, for example, rice production increased by 280 percent to 7 tonnes/ha as a result of installing irrigation and drainage systems.
39. **Soil conservation** by terracing land is of major importance in Rwanda, called “the land of a thousand hills”. Between 1999 and 2003, 1,243 ha of hillside were terraced and 1,273 ha of woodland were developed. Tree nurseries produced 16 million seedlings, equivalent to 10,000 ha of additional community wood lots. Terracing combined with swamp reclamation had a longer-term impact on the watershed and the environment. Activities also protected two lakes in the watershed, producing hydro-electricity for most of the country.
40. Techniques developed in the Ruhengeri district by the NGO HELP AGE Rwanda took into consideration the need to integrate land terracing, agro-forestry and road rehabilitation. The NGO’s technical assistance also ensured good-quality outputs. Landowners received food aid for terrace building, but the mission was of the view that they should also have been compensated during one season for lost agricultural production.
41. Results in Gikongoro were less satisfactory because of the acid soils, which needed lime to make them fertile after terracing. The cost was approximately RWF400,000/ha,² far beyond the farmers’ financial capacities. The Minister of Agriculture informed the mission that a special fund of RWF99 million had been set aside for this purpose, but extremely bad road conditions had prevented trucks from transporting the lime to the area.
42. **Infrastructure programmes** supported by WFP concentrated on rehabilitation or construction of rural feeder roads; output was 1,400 km over the period covered by the evaluation. Feeder roads often provided access to swamps and were of good quality. The mission noted that the entire community contributed to maintenance, without WFP food rations, demonstrating a keen interest in preserving the roads given their importance for marketing produce from swamplands.
43. In the hilly northern part of Ruhengeri province, construction was far more difficult in terms of organization and technical requirements. The mission nonetheless observed acceptable results. The population’s need for roads and their interest in them was unquestionable, but maintenance was problematic in view of major erosion during each rainy season and the subsequent need for regular repairs; such efforts were clearly beyond the capacity of the people residing along the road.
44. **Rural water facilities** were also supported: 604 km of canals, 50 shallow wells and 54 dams for livestock were constructed. On one site visited, 1,992 beneficiaries, of whom 63 percent were women, constructed 25 km of water pipes. Beneficiaries worked on a rotation basis, changing teams every 22 days. Drinking water was supplied to 1,500 households.
45. Water-management committees had been created on all sites visited by the mission. Charges were fixed empirically, varying from RWF1 per litre to RWF100 per month and per family for unlimited use of water. The collected fees often represented only a fraction of actual maintenance costs. Funds collected were deposited in district bank accounts and managed by the district councils. The mission considered that water charges should be calculated in such a way as to cover at least the maintenance costs of the water-distribution system. In the mission’s view, the water-management committees should themselves manage the funds collected.

² Approximately US\$690 (US\$1 = RWF575.3 in July 2004).



46. Between 1999 and 2001, WFP supported construction of 12,440 houses for homeless widows, households headed by women, survivors of the genocide and elderly and deprived people, accounting for 50 percent of all houses built in Rwanda over this period with assistance from the international community. House construction had a significant impact on food security, enabling beneficiaries to participate fully in food production once they were permanently settled.
47. On the three sites visited, the mission found houses of good quality. The beneficiaries mentioned that they now preferred to live in villages rather than being dispersed on hills as before, because they felt more secure and had better access to basic social and other services.

Food for Education

48. The Government has prioritized basic education and committed itself to providing universal primary education to all Rwandan children by 2010, a goal that requires considerable support from the international community.
49. The WFP-supported SFP was intended to contribute to Rwanda's efforts to rebuild the country's education system, which had been largely destroyed during the genocide. Activities started in February 2002 in six primary schools, rapidly expanding to 200 by February 2004: hot meals were provided for 180,000 primary schoolchildren, of whom 51.2 percent were girls, and a take-home ration of 3.6 kg of vegetable oil per family per month was given to 28,800 girls in grades 4–6 as an incentive to attend regularly and complete primary school. In most assisted schools, parents made monthly contributions of between RWF50 and RWF100 to cover costs of non-food-items and participated in canteen management.
50. The mission shared the findings of the mid-term review conducted by the country office in May–June 2003 in terms of increased enrolment and attendance as a result of the SFP (see paragraph 67). Issues of concern were (i) insufficient coordination and collaboration with UNICEF, the Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations (FAO) and other technical partners, (ii) limited administrative capacity in the Ministry of Education to manage the project in a sustainable way and (iii) insufficient monitoring by WFP, NGOs and other partners because of the large size of the project. The Government is committed to overcoming these problems with the help of partners, reflecting its interest in creating a national SFP for all primary schools in the near future.

HIV/AIDS

51. Rwanda is one of the ten African countries most affected by HIV/AIDS: estimated HIV/AIDS prevalence is 8.9 percent among people aged 15–49. By 2001, an estimated 500,000 people were living with HIV/AIDS; AIDS patients occupied over 60 percent of available hospital beds. Limited anti-retroviral (ARV) treatment was available only in a few specialized centres in the capital.
52. The four core activities of development project RWA 10079.0 consisted of (i) income-generating activities, (ii) vocational-skills training, (iii) life-skills training and (iv) peer support and counselling. By April 2004, 63 projects had been implemented through 2 international NGOs and local associations. Over the past two years, development project RWA 10079.0 has provided food rations to 95,420 people, of whom over 70 percent were women. Beneficiaries' participation in some activities increased the effectiveness of the project.



53. Major constraints to project implementation were (i) deficiencies in monitoring and reporting by WFP at sub-office level and by the Ministry of Health at district and provincial levels, (ii) lack of implementing partners, (iii) insufficient coordination in programming between government, WFP and other United Nations agencies.

FOOD MANAGEMENT

54. The WFP country office was well equipped to handle the logistics of all activities. It had (i) a central warehouse in Kigali with a capacity of 11,000 mt, (ii) four extended delivery points (EDPs) across the country, management of which has been outsourced to the Lutheran World Federation since 1998, (iii) a fleet of six 15 mt lorries and four 15 mt trailers, and (iv) a workshop for mechanical repairs. Information and communications technology (ICT) was working efficiently; following an internal audit, WINGS and COMPAS were installed in October 2003.
55. The warehouses visited were among the cleanest and best maintained ever seen by the mission. No particular problems of losses were noted: losses were reported at 0.4 percent of receipts between 1998 and 2003, and only 0.04 percent in 2003 — 13.5 mt out of 33,000 mt handled.
56. Whenever possible, the WFP country office purchased food commodities locally or in the region. Despite limited availability of locally produced food, in 2003 the country office was able to procure 3,574 mt, or 13 percent of receipts, consisting of 730 mt of maize meal, 2,304 mt of pulses and 540 mt of corn-soya blend (CSB) valued at over US\$1 million.
57. The beneficiaries were well acquainted with the quantity and types of food provided and no problems related to its use were reported. However, with regard to the vegetable oil take-home ration for girls, the mission recommended that the country office should seek clarification on existing WFP policies and guidelines concerning ration scales, and adjust the monthly ration accordingly.

MONITORING AND EVALUATION

58. With the introduction of development-oriented programmes in 2001, the country office developed logical frameworks for all projects; a monitoring and evaluation (M&E) manual was prepared and distributed to the three sub-offices, which detailed the various reporting forms to be used.
59. The assignment of four to six staff in each sub-office to monitor all aspects of WFP-supported activities was instrumental in achieving the generally high standard of reporting on inputs and outputs as seen by the mission. The mission noted with satisfaction that the extensive briefing material prepared before its arrival was complete and accurate.
60. Monitoring visits were conducted by the provincial food aid committees, composed of representatives of various ministries and WFP. This arrangement contributed to the involvement of national counterparts in project and food management and implementation of improvements.
61. Forms were filled in by implementing partners and WFP field monitors and transmitted to the sub-offices for processing and analysis for the monthly situation reports and other reports.



GENDER

62. Because of the genocide and its consequence, women accounted for at least 60 percent of FFA and FFT participants but were under-represented in project decision-making fora such as food distribution committees. As in other countries, the main reason was their low level of education and lack of self-confidence, which prevented them from standing for election. To improve the situation, WFP continued sensitization of implementing partners and encouraged them to support adult functional literacy courses for women to enable them to benefit more from development opportunities.
63. The gender impact study conducted by WFP in March 2001 concluded that WFP-assisted recovery activities significantly enhanced the social status of women in the community, enabling women to own assets and develop a sense of belonging and promoting reconciliation.

COORDINATION AND PARTNERSHIP

64. Activities were implemented in cooperation with ministry departments and local authorities. Food aid committees had been created with the help of WFP's sub-offices and were operational in each province, setting priorities, targeting beneficiaries, distributing food and carrying out M&E of project implementation and results.
65. International and local NGOs and United Nations agencies were also important partners. Regrettably, available resources of all partners decreased as the socio-political situation improved, which is the main reason why enhanced partnerships with UNICEF, FAO, the United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA) and the Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS (UNAIDS) did not materialize as much as had been hoped. This constraint made it more difficult for WFP, which was operating under funding constraints, to ensure adequate technical backstopping for activities in its portfolio.

RESULTS

66. The mission concluded that WFP food assistance played an important part in avoiding a major humanitarian crisis and helped to reduce the suffering of the affected population. WFP's relief food assistance has undoubtedly averted a considerable number of deaths among the most vulnerable people and prevented the rates of malnutrition from worsening.
67. Implementation of SFP in selected provinces over the last two years has contributed to increased resistance to disease. In education, the following results were noted: (i) school drop-outs, late arrivals and absenteeism were reduced (attendance reaching 90 percent to 95 percent), (ii) energy expenditure was eliminated among children had previously gone home at lunchtime and arrived late for afternoon classes, (iii) attention spans were increased, especially in the afternoon, (iv) schoolgirls were no longer kept at home but permitted to continue in school, (v) proceeds from the sale of vegetable oil reportedly covered the costs of school fees, uniforms and textbooks and supported income-generating and food-security activities, (vi) parents, especially mothers, had more time for activities and (vii) 2,000 jobs for cooks, mainly men, were created at canteens.
68. The immediate effects of the recovery programmes on the livelihoods of beneficiaries and communities were in addition to (i) increased household food availability, (ii) increased incomes, particularly for women engaged in income-generating activities, (iii) improved access to services and (iv) less migration in search of paid labour. Income



from rice production, for example, was estimated at RWF40,000 per year per household. Beneficiaries and farmers associations met by the mission mentioned that their living conditions had improved considerably and that having provided for food, health and educational needs they were able to invest in inputs and eventually join the national social-security system. The time spent by women in fetching water was reduced from 2–3 hours per day to 20 minutes, enabling them to allocate more time to household and income-generating activities. The number of patients attending health centres for water-borne diseases was reduced significantly.

LESSONS LEARNED

69. After the early stages of the EMOP, when saving lives was the priority, implementation of targeted distribution was started as soon as possible to establish recovery activities that addressed one of the core problems of the beneficiaries — food insecurity. The risk that WFP assistance would perpetuate dependency did not materialize, because the relief and development programmes were designed to eliminate dependency by ensuring asset creation in agricultural production, housing, education and training as soon as possible.
70. Given Rwanda's post-emergency situation, the use of resources was as flexible as possible, facilitating the shift from emergency general distribution to targeted distribution under recovery activities. The shift to FFA was one of the best initiatives of the WFP country office and the Government in favour of the affected population in that it helped to rebuild the confidence of a population that had suffered genocide and war. Receiving food rather than cash for work done was an aspect of WFP's assistance that was appreciated by all beneficiaries interviewed by the mission.
71. WFP was able to provide sufficient quality staff, good leadership, positive and creative management and an effective office and logistics. These elements were absolutely necessary in shifting from purely emergency assistance to a recovery programme which, by definition, has to start in an adverse environment after a major crisis. The WFP country office has also tried to meet staffing needs in terms of quantity and competence, and to build capacity through training to meet evolving needs.
72. The involvement of the Government at all levels, national and local, was indispensable to move beyond emergency relief to recovery and development. The creation of provincial food aid committees in each province and support for them was a particularly responsible step by the Government, demonstrating its commitment to participating fully in the process of recovery.

RECOMMENDATIONS

73. A summary of the mission's main recommendations and actions envisaged or taken by WFP is given in the Annex to this report.



**EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT RESPONSE SUMMARY —
WFP'S PORTFOLIO OF ACTIVITIES IN RWANDA**

OEDE recommendations (May 2004)	Action by	Management response and action taken (July 2004)
Nutrition and micronutrients		
Ensure that baseline nutrition surveys are carried out in WFP operational areas with persistent malnutrition.	Country office	WFP is discussing feasibility of the baseline surveys with UNICEF. The major constraints are financial, because the PRRO has no budget for baseline surveys. A sentinel survey has already been initiated in food-insecure Bugesera in collaboration with <i>Médecins sans frontières</i> ; WFP will seek increased partnership with NGOs to establish more sentinel survey sites in other areas as resourcing permits.
Review the tripartite MOU for nutrition programmes clarifying the obligations of all parties in order to ensure adequate food supplies and equipment for SFP and TFP.	Country office	The current tripartite agreement signed on 11 November 2002 between the Ministry of Health, UNICEF and WFP defines the roles and obligations of all the parties involved in SFP and TFP. WFP will increase sensitization of UNICEF and the Government to ensure that all parties respect their commitments.
With the Government, UNICEF and implementing partners, continue to reduce the number of traditional nutrition centres, targeting those in medium food-security zones and establishing mechanisms for adopting an integrated, community-based approach to address nutrition and health problems.	Country office in consultation with UNICEF	The number of nutrition centres was reduced from 252 in 2002 to the current 93; this is continuing. WFP will continue to coordinate with UNICEF and other partners to enhance implementation of community-based programmes designed to address the root causes of malnutrition and health problems.
Through the Government, UNICEF and other partners, ensure collection, analysis and dissemination of baseline micronutrient prevalence data for vitamin A and iron, preferably using biochemical indicators, followed by periodical assessments, of vitamin A deficiency, iodine deficiency disorders and anaemia amongst women and pre-school and school-age children.	Country office in consultation with UNICEF	WFP will discuss this with the Ministry of Health and UNICEF before the end of 2004, with implementation possibly starting in 2005. Again, there is a financial constraint in that there is no provision for such surveys in the PRRO budget. This would probably have to be included in the baseline surveys, particularly where pre-schoolers and women are involved.
FFA		
The involvement of the Ministry of Agriculture and technical partners such as FAO and NGOs with experience in the field should be solicited, particularly for increased contributions of inputs, in addition to WFP's food assistance.	Country office in consultation with FAO	The Ministry of Agriculture is involved in implementing most major agricultural projects with the technical/financial support of FAO, mainly the swamp-reclamation and rice projects that require technical studies, including environmental impact studies. At the provincial level, FFW projects are cleared by the food aid committee, which includes the Director of Agriculture. Partnership with NGOs will continue for



**EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT RESPONSE SUMMARY —
WFP'S PORTFOLIO OF ACTIVITIES IN RWANDA**

OEDE recommendations (May 2004)	Action by	Management response and action taken (July 2004)
		supervision of activities and provision of technical and material support. WFP will continue to seek donor funding for the required non-food items.
Land terracing is an integral part of watershed management and should not be implemented in isolation. It is essential to integrate agro-forestry and livestock from the beginning in the global plan proposed to beneficiaries.	Country office in consultation with FAO	The MOU for FFW between WFP and the partners will be reviewed by August 2004 to ensure that agreements for land terracing include a commitment by the partner to include agro-forestry practices that would improve the soil productivity and provide fodder for livestock and commitment for the provision of other required inputs such as organic manure and lime for acid soils. Few partners have the required funding level, however.
Maintenance of a feeder road in mountainous areas subject to recurrent major erosion should be included in FFW construction/rehabilitation planning from the beginning of the project.	Country office	The MOU for road rehabilitation is to be reviewed by August 2004 to include commitment to establish arrangements for maintenance after WFP's assistance.
Water committees should manage villagers' contributions rather than refer these matters to the district level.	Country office in consultation with FAO	The MOU for water projects is to be reviewed to include arrangements for collection and use of villagers' contributions.
Food for education (FFE)		
Establish joint programming with FAO/Ministry of Agriculture, following up on pilot projects for school gardens and if possible for expanding the activity.	Country office in consultation with FAO	A proposal has been drafted for the joint intervention of United Nations agencies in the education sector centred on WFP's SFP. The programme will involve UNICEF, FAO, UNAIDS, WHO and WFP and includes the establishment of school gardens. The draft will be discussed in the meeting of United Nations Heads of Agencies and will be operational from the coming scholastic year in January 2005.
Follow-up to ongoing pilot activities such as (i) deworming, (ii) vitamin A and iron micronutrient supplementation, (iii) promotion of improved school hygiene and sanitation, (iv) health, nutrition and hygiene education for behaviour change, (v) malaria control and (vi) HIV-AIDS awareness; if possible, expand activities.	Country office in consultation with FAO, UNICEF, WHO	A project proposal for deworming and micronutrient supplementation was prepared jointly by WFP and the Government; it is currently being reviewed at WFP, UNICEF and WHO. The initiatives of a minimum package for school health and nutrition programmes currently undertaken in collaboration with <i>Médecins sans frontières</i> and Population Services International (PSI) will continue.



**EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT RESPONSE SUMMARY —
WFP'S PORTFOLIO OF ACTIVITIES IN RWANDA**

OEDE recommendations (May 2004)	Action by	Management response and action taken (July 2004)
Develop exit strategies for school feeding consisting of increasing contributions of food by parents over a period of several years to ensure sustainability if WFP were no longer able to provide food aid.	Country office	A meeting will be held before end of July 2004, chaired by the Ministry of Education and involving all stakeholders, to discuss the strategies for sustainability of SFP.
Improve management and monitoring of school feeding, particularly in partnership with Ministry of Education, FAO, UNICEF and WHO.	Country office in consultation with FAO, UNICEF, WHO	WFP supported the creation of the Country Programme Coordination Unit (CPCU) based in the Ministry of Local Government, Commercial Development and Social Affairs, which is responsible for coordination of government contributions and activities in the country programme. The creation of CPCU is expected to improve government monitoring and reporting. Collaboration by FAO, UNICEF, WHO and UNAIDS will be improved through the joint United Nations programme under preparation.
HIV/AIDS		
Expand HIV/AIDS programming in the four main areas, increasing the number of partners, and targeting PLWHA and recipients of ARV treatment.	Country office	In process and expected to improve with the planned home-based care and nutritional support that will target PLWH/A and recipients of ARV treatment.
Formalize links between HIV/AIDS programming and FFA and other food-security activities to standardize an awareness-raising and prevention component in all WFP-assisted programmes.	Country office	The link between HIV/AIDS programming and other WFP activities initiated under the HIV/AIDS pilot project will continue under the country programme in collaboration with the Ministry of Health, <i>Médecins sans frontières</i> and PSI.
Link HIV/AIDS programming with prevention of mother-to-child transmission (PMTCT) programmes, providing opportunities for mothers living with HIV/AIDS and their infants to benefit from longer-term assistance and to increase their access to food production and income generating activities.	Country office	In process under the HIV/AIDS pilot project and will continue under the country programme.



ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

ARV	anti-retroviral
CPCU	Country Programme Coordination Unit
CSB	corn-soya blend
EDP	extended delivery point
EMOP	emergency operation
FAO	Food and Agriculture Organization of the United Nations
FEWS/NET	Famine Early-Warning System Network
FFA	food for assets
FFE	food for education
FFT	food for training
ICT	information and communications technology
IDP	internally displaced person
M&E	monitoring and evaluation
MCH	mother-and-child health
NGO	non-governmental organization
PMTCT	prevention of mother-to-child transmission
PRRO	protracted relief and recovery operation
PRSP	Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper
PSI	Population Service International
QAP	quick-action project
SFP	supplementary feeding programme
SO	special operation
TFP	therapeutic feeding programme
UNAIDS	Joint United Nations Programme on HIV/AIDS
UNDP	United Nations Development Programme
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
UNHCR	Office of the United Nation High Commissioner for Refugees
UNICEF	United Nations Children's Fund
VAM	vulnerability analysis and mapping

