

برنامج
الأغذية
العالمي



Programme
Alimentaire
Mondial

World
Food
Programme

Programa
Mundial
de Alimentos

**Executive Board
Second Regular Session**

Rome, 17 - 19 May 2000

INFORMATION NOTES

SUMMARY OF EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS AND MANAGEMENT RESPONSE— PRRO CAMBODIA 6038.00

This document should be read in conjunction with the document “Mid-Term Evaluation of PRRO Cambodia 6038.00” (WFP/EB.2/2000/3/6).



Distribution: GENERAL

WFP/EB.2/2000/INF/9

11 May 2000

ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

This document is printed in a limited number of copies. Executive Board documents are available on WFP's WEB site (http://www.wfp.org/eb_public/EB_Home.html).













RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
ADVOCACY		
<p>WFP's advocacy role, both local and national, should include efforts to obtain minimum guarantees of individual and community ownership of assets generated and supported by the PRRO. This includes, for instance, ensuring that where food for work is used to clear land, land remain the property of the beneficiary family.</p>	Country office	<p>Many WFP recovery activities aim not only at short-term food security, but also longer-term asset creation. The issue of rights and access to land, forests, fisheries, educational and health facilities and durable shelter must therefore be addressed at the national and community levels. The first stage will be to define and disseminate an ethical framework compatible with WFP's programme in Cambodia. WFP will work closely with government authorities to incorporate and consolidate the defined principles at all levels. A proactive advocacy strategy will require greater awareness and training of staff and partners in non-discriminatory rights to food, productive resources, gender equity and participatory development.</p>
TARGETING		
<p>There should be less emphasis on commune-specific targeting. WFP should move towards the concept of clustering communes and integrated regional planning.</p> <p>Similar methodologies and criteria should be phased in for targeting RTC and PET communes. Targeting criteria for beneficiaries of Social Sector activities should be more clearly defined.</p> <p>WFP should review the appropriateness of the current targeting process, taking better account of regional differences, particular local food economies and income-generating strategies, and the data quality associated with certain indicators.</p> <p>WFP should identify distinct target groups with common food insecurity and vulnerability characteristics, e.g. young widows, the handicapped and chronically ill, or the under-employed landless, and design targeted interventions to address their specific needs</p>	Country office	<p>The PRRO expansion will place greater emphasis on sustained WFP presence and diversity of projects, mainly in remote, highly vulnerable and low-potential areas. The country office has already initiated the process of establishing clear criteria of eligibility for beneficiaries, implementing partner organizations and activities to be supported. These criteria that will be in line with WFP principles will be applied to all new schemes assisted under the new PRRO.</p> <p>Continuing on WFP's earlier clustering of target communes within high priority districts and low-potential food economy/ecology zones, the new PRRO seeks to further refine this system by identifying core cluster areas. They will benefit from sustained presence, and diversity of WFP projects over the next three years and be defined along three interrelated criteria commune clusters, ensuring that benefits accrued to one set of villages complement those of another (e.g. common schools, market access (roads), irrigation schemes); complementary recovery activities, including Social Support projects alongside FFW schemes to ensure that particularly vulnerable people (e.g. young single mothers, handicapped persons or the elderly) are not marginalized; and a link with commune development plans under the <i>Seila</i> process (Government's decentralized planning process). In addition, WFP will expand links with effective partners in areas where integrated rural development projects are planned or ongoing.</p>

RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
WFP should continue to give substantial weight to qualitative assessments by experts familiar with local conditions; the role for the VAM unit should be to inform the process with complementary data rather than to drive it.	Country office	Qualitative inputs are extremely important in the current VAM set-up. The entire targeting process starts with WFP field staff/government/NGO discussions on vulnerable communes. This list is then taken and filtered to select the most vulnerable among them within the threshold of WFP food aid/resourcing constraints. Monthly periodic inputs from WFP field staff are collected and targeting appropriately changed to suit their recommendations.
M & E		
WFP should identify clear measurable indicators on short-term effects (relating to filling the 'hunger-gap'), long-term impact (food security, 'social cohesion', reduced health risks, etc.), and quantitative targets for these indicators.	Country office	Continuing analyses within the Programme and VAM Units offer clear evidence that the food indeed reaches the poorest of the poor and that food benefits are equal across different types of households while meeting significant parts of the food deficit. Ongoing research on questions of longer-term impact such as food security and social cohesion needs to be recast in a more operational manner in terms of tracking and evaluating on a periodic basis. WFP has set up a working group on M&E for the new PRRO which is currently defining an operational set of indicators and processes to better monitor and evaluate the PRRO.
<p>The current monitoring and evaluation plan for 2000 should be reviewed to: a) establish a more realistic work-plan, including specific research questions, a conceptual framework for data analysis, and more narrowly defined indicators; and b) include a comprehensive report on programme effects and impact. WFP might also benefit from more senior consultancy input on issues related to food security.</p> <p>Assessment of programme effects should become part of the regular monitoring and reporting system, incorporating indicators which could form the basis for (longer-term) impact assessment. Regular narrative and quantitative reporting on the effects of the programme on beneficiaries' lives should be emphasized.</p>	Country office	<p>Although called M&E, the current system is a good reporting system collecting information on inputs, processes and outputs. There is a lack of systematic data collection to measure outcomes and effects of FFW projects as well as beneficiary impacts. The existing reporting system needs to be streamlined to utilize the collected data. An M&E system will collect data four times a year from the same households as well as from control households in similar villages as of 2000. It will however be difficult and not cost-effective to measure beneficiary impact or effects of the social support activities.</p> <p>WFP staff and an external consultant are working to review the existing reporting system and identify gaps. Research questions include quantifying the impact of improved infrastructure (roads) and food basket. Analysis could show changes in travel, medical and food expenditure, in addition to opportunities for increased income with improved access, increased consumption both in quantity and quality, and therefore improved nutrition and fewer seasonal fluctuations.</p>

RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
GENDER		
<p>In order to identify and address the major constraints to the participation of households headed by young women in FFW activities, and to build on the recommendations of the recent WFP Gender Study, WFP should consider working more closely with the Ministry of Women's Affairs. This might include the identification of complementary and alternative interventions specifically addressing the food security and nutritional needs of young women with children in single-headed households.</p>	Country office	<p>"According to Our Strength/Taam Kamlang" is the first analysis of an extensive gender-focused survey undertaken during 1999 which is being processed into a series of working papers. The analysis has determined the new integrated approach and the formulation of specific indicators for food-related and gender-related poverty.</p> <p>Special programmatic interventions will benefit households headed by young women; these include child-minding activities on FFW sites, family fish ponds, tree nursery and planting activities. New projects are being considered in close consultation/cooperation with the Ministry of Women's Affairs.</p>
PROGRAMME		
<p>Annual technical assessments of FFW projects should continue, though the project selection should also compare recently completed projects with those undertaken in the past three years.</p> <p>The technical assessment should compare 'stand-alone' WFP/PDRD projects with those supported by other technical assistance and/or maintenance agreements with development agencies. A cost/benefit analysis should include recommendations drawn from this comparative study.</p>	Country office	Annual technical assessments will continue and their scope be expanded. A cost-benefit analysis comparing WFP/PDRD projects with those supported by other technical assistance partners will be included in the next technical assessment.
<p>The selection of projects within the Social Sector should adhere to explicit criteria and prioritization rather than relying solely on the perceived efficiency and reliability of implementing partners. In terms of sustainability, greater emphasis should be placed on projects implemented through Government ministries.</p>	Country office	Eligibility criteria for projects assisted by WFP (in terms of beneficiaries, partners' reliability and objectives, strategy and activities) are being developed in close consultation with line Ministries, NGOs and WFP field staff. Line Ministries will be further involved while WFP will emphasize capacity-building at the central and local levels.

RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
<p>WFP should expand its collaboration with UNICEF, government agencies and NGOs specifically addressing family health care issues. Where appropriate, activities under WFP's quick action project Cambodia 6188.00 should be more closely linked to FFW projects.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>Other UN agencies, as well as government institutions and NGOs which have integrated development programmes specifically addressing family health care issues have been closely consulted in the design of the new PRRO. Complementary interventions have been planned in the new locations of UNICEF's "Community Action for Child Rights" programme. Other examples of cooperation relate to implementation of joint health, nutrition and food security surveys with sister organizations and concerned NGOs. WFP seeks more government institutions' involvement in this sector as in the design of development project 6188.00 on Supplementary Feeding which complements other partners' community development initiatives.</p>
<p>The school feeding pilot programme should be retained in those school clusters where additional inputs from EQIP/MoEYS are available. Where possible, complementary area programmes in health, hygiene and nutrition should be sought to further encourage community mobilization and commitment.</p> <p>The country office should explore optional funding mechanisms for this programme outside the PRRO as early as possible, preferably before the end of 2001.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>The school feeding pilot project will be retained where assistance from the WB-assisted EQIP project is ascertained. A joint UNESCO/WFP appraisal mission planned for June 2000 will determine the relevance of further expansion of the activities with EQIP and other potential partners outside of the PRRO as from the school year 2001/2002. Government institutions and partner organizations will be sought with a view to providing complementary health, hygiene and nutrition interventions.</p>
<p>Rice banks should be extended in targeted communes, contingent upon a prior understanding of credit modalities and strictly monitored outcome. Standardized book-keeping, contracts and reporting formats should be developed by MRD and WFP on the understanding that WFP's initial food input is always a one-off start-up contribution.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>WFP will work with the Ministry of Rural Development to develop standard training and implementation modalities to expand rice banks in targeted communes.</p>
<p>CAPACITY-BUILDING</p>		
<p>WFP should develop a training schedule with its partners as part of an ultimate exit strategy. The ability of these partners to secure funds for needed inputs/services must be determined within the three-year PRRO expansion.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>A capacity-building exercise for operational partners will be a central component of the PRRO expansion and exit strategy. WFP staff and counterparts should be qualified to confidently apply participatory approaches in their work with communities, and to be able to effectively evaluate the application of this approach with other partners. They should also be able to accurately implement monitoring systems.</p>

RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
<p>WFP should become more fully involved in facilitating commune/village-level discussions generated by the <i>Seila</i> process and its equivalent in other areas. This might include, for instance, helping village animators become more aware of project possibilities based on food aid.</p>	Country office	<p>Capacity-building of local communities will be a central component of the next PRRO expansion. WFP will collaborate with, and help develop, the <i>Seila</i> process which will enhance community identification and ownership of WFP-supported projects. The country office is currently strengthening links between the <i>Seila</i> local planning process and WFP programming through the Ministry of Rural Development. In 2000, a joint WFP/ Government/UNDP evaluation of WFP's collaboration with <i>Seila</i> will be organized in anticipation of its expansion to more provinces by 2002.</p>
<p>Staff capacity-building efforts should be placed within the framework of a clear career development strategy. Further efforts should be made to establish a framework for staff training, the selection of trainees and appropriate subject areas.</p> <p>A monitoring system should be established to assess progress made in achieving capacity-building among staff and implementing partners.</p>	Country office	<p>In order to develop an accurate inventory of knowledge gaps and skills available, the PRRO is undertaking a skills inventory and training needs assessment among WFP and Ministry of Rural Development related staff. This will be followed up by a training plan for specific aspects of food aid as well as management and monitoring and evaluation. Regular training workshops for Government staff in Gender and Development, Community Development, Advocacy and FFW-technical proficiency will continue. Simultaneously, the VAM Unit will continue its series of training and workshops with seven counterpart ministries in food security analysis, targeting, GIS, mapping and statistical analysis, with a view to handing over the management of these functions within the three-year PRRO.</p>
LOGISTICS		
<p>The transfer of transport operations from CRC to the commercial sector should continue, with final hand-over completed by the end of 2000, pending a full review of the cost-effectiveness of the new arrangement.</p> <p>A strategy should be developed by WFP concerning the disposal by the end of 2000 of WFP-owned assets operated by the CRC – trucks, workshop equipment and tools.</p>	Country office	<p>A logistics expert has assisted the country office to develop different disposal alternatives and elaborate a plan for the disposal of the trucks which headquarters has approved. An intensive exercise is in course to monitor, evaluate and report the performance of commercial transport operations measured in tonnage and time employed to deliver from receipt of landside transport instruction. Amendments to the current agreement will be made to confirm CRC's acceptance of managing the workshop without a WFP Workshop adviser and for the accountability and responsibility for the safety and road worthiness of the trucks. Additional transporters will be short-listed (market intelligence, interviews and questionnaires), requirements reviewed and transport rates with commercial transporters renegotiated.</p>
		<p>The country office has to complete the inventory and ascertain the value of spare parts (including tyres), tools and equipment, hand over the remaining spare parts and tyres for trucks, and finally dispose of remaining trucks as per disposal plan.</p>

RECOMMENDATION TO WFP (JANUARY 2000)	ACTION BY (APRIL 2000)	MANAGEMENT RESPONSE & ACTION TAKEN TO DATE (APRIL 2000)
<p>WFP should introduce regular training for logistics warehouse staff in warehouse management, loss and spillage management, and reporting procedures. Standardized reporting forms and procedures should be introduced as a matter of urgency.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>The country office will hire logistics storekeepers for provincial warehouses (to be paid from LTSH), design a Warehouse and Stock Management Workshop to deliver training modules in standard forms and procedures, including post-c.i.f. losses management procedures, and conduct a series of workshops for WFP and - at a later date - selected Government staff.</p>
<p>OUTLOOK</p>		
<p>In preparing a PRRO expansion, WFP should examine each component of the programme with a view to gradually phasing out support for certain activities in line with the recovery time frame. A realistic assessment should be made of the conditions necessary for the evolution of certain components into development projects; the closure of certain programme elements should also be anticipated within the timeframe. Government, NGO and inter-governmental partners should be involved in planning the new PRRO to ensure a clear understanding of and commitment to an exit strategy and to its inherent risks and assumptions.</p>	<p>Country office</p>	<p>All components of the new PRRO expansion have been designed to accommodate and promote an iterative withdrawal of recovery activities while at the same time evaluating possibilities for their transfer into 'developmental' projects as well as identification of new approaches. This process will be carried out in the most participatory and inclusive manner possible.</p>