

برنامج  
الأغذية  
العالمي



Programme  
Alimentaire  
Mondial

World  
Food  
Programme

Programa  
Mundial  
de Alimentos

Executive Board  
Third Regular Session

Rome, 19 - 22 October 1999

## EVALUATION REPORTS

### Agenda item 4

***For consideration***

# E

Distribution: GENERAL  
**WFP/EB.3/99/4/1**

6 February 2009  
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

## END-OF-TERM EVALUATION OF COUNTRY PROGRAMME— PAKISTAN (1994–1998)

### ABSTRACT

The Pakistan Country Programme represented the first attempt by WFP to reformulate its operations into a programme. It was approved, partly retroactively, in October 1996. Existing projects were packaged together to form the 1994–1998 Country Programme, with an emphasis more on synchronizing with other United Nations operations than on developing a new focused Country Programme. Consequently, it was designed without the benefit of clear indicators for measuring results. The conclusions of this evaluation should be seen in this light.

The Pakistan Country Programme comprises two distinct intervention areas: in the health and education sectors, under the Government's Social Action Programme (SAP), and in natural resource management (NRM).

The mission concluded that in Pakistan food security was more a function of income rather than availability and therefore food aid provided through the current Country Programme should be seen as an income transfer rather than the provision of food for direct consumption.

The Country Programme was found to be well integrated with the Government's own development plans for the concerned sectors, and also to reflect the priorities of the donor community. The programme approach had enabled WFP to more efficiently adjust activities as a response to an irregular supply of commodities. However, there was a need to consider interventions in a broader context to ensure the desirable impact of WFP assistance on the target population groups. This would require the establishment of stronger linkages with programmes of other development partners. The mission found that the experiences in this respect varied considerably with interventions under NRM more likely to be complemented by supportive actions from others, while within SAP there was generally less association of this nature. While the full impact of the interventions would be known only at a later stage, findings to date were mixed. The mission found that in particular the health intervention needed to be reassessed.

The report includes a number of recommendations aimed at strengthening partnerships with other donors, increasing the involvement of local communities, further refining targeting, enhancing monitoring, and establishing a more efficient operational relationship with the Government.

## NOTE TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

**This document is submitted for consideration to the Executive Board.**

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document, to contact the WFP staff focal point(s) indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, OEDE:                      A. Wilkinson                      tel.: 066513-2029

Chief Evaluation Officer:   R. Huss                      tel.: 066513-2358

Should you have any questions regarding matters of dispatch of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact the Documentation and Meetings Clerk (tel.: 066513-2641).



---

## LIST OF ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

ACC	Administrative Committee on Coordination
AsDB	Asian Development Bank
CP	Country Programme
CSO	Country Strategy Outline
DFID	Department for International Development
EAD	Economic Affairs Division
EMIS	(Government) Education Management Information System
HMIS	(Government) Health Management Information System
IUCN	World Conservation Unit
LHW	Local health worker
MinFAL	Ministry of Food, Agriculture and livestock
NRCD	Natural Resource and Community Development
NRM	Natural Resource Management
NWFP	North-West Frontier Province
P&D	Planning and Development
PBM	Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal
SAP	Social Action Programme
SSAP	Support to Social Action Programme
VDC	Village Development Committee



## INTRODUCTION

1. In line with resolution 47/199 of the United Nations General Assembly, further defined by the Administrative Committee on Coordination (ACC), the Pakistan Country Programme (CP) reflects the first attempt by WFP to reformulate its operations and make them more integrated, flexible and harmonized with other United Nations programmes. It represents a departure from the piece-meal, project-oriented approach of the past. Reflecting the adoption of the new programme approach, WFP's operations were anchored in a strategy set forth in the December 1994 Country Strategy Outline (CSO) for Pakistan. The Country Programme Document, outlining the specific interventions supporting the strategy, was prepared on the basis of the CSO and structured to conform to the planning cycles of both the Government and the United Nations system. The CP was approved, partly retroactively, in October 1996.

## THE COUNTRY PROGRAMME

2. The Pakistan Country Programme consists of interventions on two distinct fronts. Resources have been provided for activities under the Social Action Programme (SAP), specifically for interventions in health and education, and in natural resource management (NRM).
3. The social sector interventions in health aim at encouraging expectant and nursing mothers to visit health centres regularly. They also include the promotion and increased use of primary health care facilities. The programme was implemented in selected districts of the Provinces of Punjab, Balochistan, North West Frontier Province (NWFP) and Sindh, as well as in Jammu and Kashmir. These areas were chosen on the basis of their low social and economic indicators. Interventions in the education sector aim at increasing enrolment, improving attendance and reducing drop-out rates of girls at primary schools. Additional objectives include the reduction of teacher absenteeism. The education sector programme was implemented in selected districts in the provinces of NWFP and Balochistan, and may soon be extended to Sindh and Punjab. Districts were chosen largely on the basis of low participation rates of girls in primary education.
4. The incentive in both social sector programmes has been the distribution of a single high-value food commodity—edible oil. In schools, for each month of “full attendance”, teachers and students received one 5-kg tin of edible oil per person. In the health sector, a total of four tins was distributed for specific pre- and post-natal visits, including vaccination and immunization.
5. Five relatively separate exercises have been amalgamated to constitute interventions under NRM. They include: Pakistan 2451.00—Assistance to Tarela and Mangla Watersheds, covering four districts in the Hazara Division of NWFP; Pakistan 4003.00—Rural Development in the North-Eastern Territory; Pakistan 4659.00—Environmental Rehabilitation in Malakand Division of NWFP; Pakistan 2309.00—Rural Development Works in NWFP and the Federally Administered Tribal Areas; and Pakistan 4377.00—Rural Development in Balochistan. All five projects had been operational before their incorporation into the Country Programme. With an assumed linkage between a degraded environment and poverty, attention initially focused on the physical or environmental aspects such as the rehabilitation of soils, improvement of water percolation and control,



and the sustainable supply of woody biomass and grasses. However, during the course of implementation there was a shift in scope and focus. A social forestry approach with an emphasis on social organization involving community management, self-reliance and participatory decision-making has been adopted as the general theme in all the interventions.

6. Two elements distinguish the NRM interventions. The first is that all five projects have been supported by supplementary financial or technical assistance from other agencies (UNDP and national NGOs, Sarhad Rural Support Corporation and Women's Development Association) or bilateral donors (Australia, Germany, Italy and the Netherlands). The second is that food support is provided through the mechanism of a food stamp scheme. WFP-provided wheat is converted into cash by the Federal Government at the port of entry, Karachi. The cash is used to purchase food stamps from Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal (PBM), an autonomous Government body which implements the Government's own food stamp programme. The food stamps are delivered to project authorities for distribution to participants who, in turn, exchange them at face value for a variety of foods at designated stores in sub-districts. The advantage of the food stamp programme is that it avoids the payment of high transport, storage and distribution costs involved in moving commodities from port to beneficiaries, eliminates post-c.i.f. losses, and provides a diversified food basket for beneficiaries while limiting WFP's provision to a single commodity.
7. A smaller third level of intervention under the Country Programme includes support to the operation of a safety net programme for the most vulnerable Afghan refugees, including support for some new refugees. This follows the phase-out of the refugee care and maintenance programme. The interventions support activities for girls in primary schools and vocational training for women.
8. The Country Programme (1994–1998) anticipated a total delivery of food resources of about US\$ 50 million, averaging some US\$ 10 million a year, roughly divided equally between the SAP and NRM programmes. No anticipatory allocations were indicated for any refugee or emergency operations. Actual WFP costs amount to a total of about US\$ 37.3 million over the same period, divided almost equally: 18.3 million for the social sectors (13 million for health and 5.3 million for education) and approximately 19 million for NRM. The Annex provides detailed figures. In the education sector, the total number of beneficiaries amounted to 53,300, at a cost per beneficiary of about US\$ 100. It has been difficult to assess beneficiary numbers in the case of NRM. A notional estimate of about 115,500 beneficiaries indicates a per capita cost of US\$ 165.<sup>1</sup> These figures refer only to people benefiting directly from the interventions. The creation of common assets as a consequence of NRM interventions implies that the total number of beneficiaries is considerably larger and corresponding costs lower. However, no such estimates were possible. In the case of the health interventions, it has not been possible to assess the total number of beneficiaries on the basis of the information available.

---

<sup>1</sup> Cost per beneficiary figures indicated here are based on the cost of WFP food input alone and does not include non-food items cost or the budgetary support costs provided by the Government for transport and distribution in the case of the SAP interventions.



## THE EVALUATION

9. Programme evaluation reviews the broader aspects of programme direction as well as elements of implementation. It has to be recognized that some of the parameters against which the interventions are being assessed had not originally been explicit objectives of the interventions themselves. It would not be fair to judge this Country Programme, approved in 1996 and based on a CSO from 1994, entirely by standards established only in 1998. It was designed without the benefit of clear indicators for measuring results. However, the flexible nature of the programme approach should have allowed some modification of the interventions over time. As shown in the following, some adjustments were also made. The assessment is presented under seven broad groupings, as follows: Country Setting and Rationale for WFP Operations; Programme Contents and Design; People Orientation: Targeting, Gender and Participatory Process; Impact and Sustainability; Programme Implementation; WFP Performance; and Government Performance.

## COUNTRY SETTING AND RATIONALE FOR WFP OPERATIONS

10. Many studies of poverty in Pakistan indicate that substantial segments of the population fall below the national average.<sup>1</sup> Yet, while information on the considerable disparities within regions and between income groups<sup>2</sup> is available, there is little firm data on the poverty profile or on the location of the poor. The critical element, from the perspective of establishing a rationale for food aid and WFP assistance, is the fact that food is not at a premium in the country. Noted wide variances in consumption are generally related to incomes rather than food availability. For poverty groups, food security is more a function of incomes and the inter-relationship between food security and other measures of poverty, such as high birth rates and high levels of maternal and child mortality, and low education levels. Consequently, food aid provided through the current Country Programme should be seen from the perspective of an income transfer rather than as the provision of food directly for consumption.
11. In the context of the above, the income transfer approach towards targeted groups, implicit in both the social and natural resource management interventions, has been appropriate. In the case of activities related to natural resource management, an adapted income transfer approach has meant a revision of the direct distribution of a number of food commodities to the distribution of food stamps almost equivalent to that of cash. To its credit, the flexibility of the CP in adopting this approach not only brought the programme in line with the reality of food availability in Pakistan, but also saved considerable resources.

<sup>1</sup> There are a number of recent studies that indicate the proportion of people falling below a certain poverty line and between rural and urban areas. Government of Pakistan (GOP), Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock, 'World Food Summit—Country Position Paper—Case of Pakistan', 1996; Mahbulul Haq & Khadija Haq, 'Human Development in South Asia', Karachi 1998; IFPRI, 'Poverty, Household Food Security and Nutrition in Pakistan' Research Report 96, 1993.

<sup>2</sup> Thus, while the available food per capita for the country was estimated at 2,570 kcals per day in 1995–96, studies indicate that the proportion of people actually consuming less than 1,800 kcals per day varied from 33 percent of households in Dir, a targeted district, to 13 percent of households in Attock, a district that was not targeted.



12. The rationale for interventions in the social sectors, specifically the health and education of women and girls, is well placed. Within poverty groups, the condition of women, particularly rural women, is perhaps one of the worst in Asia. With extremely low levels of education, short average life span, high incidence of maternal mortality and disease, and little decision-making power, rural women in Pakistan remain in a precarious state. The rationale for support, therefore, is seen directly as part of WFP's Gender Agenda, aimed at helping women gain equal access to, and control of, the basic necessities of life. The provision of incentives—in the form of an income transfer—to women to visit health centres and young girls to attend schools is an appropriate vehicle for the target groups to achieve the goal of economic and social development.
13. In contrast, the rationale for WFP support in the natural resource management sector is weak and represents, to some extent, the weight of WFP's past association in this sector. Based on the assumption of a linkage between a degraded environment and poverty, the overall initial objectives of the interventions were macro-level environmental goals. The interventions included the rehabilitation of physical infrastructure, in particular the protection of major watersheds and dams, the conservation of bio-diversity, and the production of fuelwood and grasses. The focus on the poor was perceived as a vehicle towards environmental rehabilitation and not as an end in itself. To the credit of the CP, however, there has been a substantive transformation of the goals during implementation. Programme goals were revised to focus on social forestry integrated with community management, and described in terms of the self-reliance of local communities. Emphasis has been placed on social organization, the self-reliance of local people, their participation in implementation decisions, and on the use of assets created. The revised interventions have been presented under the new name of Natural Resource and Community Development (NRCD). The adoption of these new goals, however, has not been uniform among the five area-based activities in this sector and the new approach requires more time and adaptation to local circumstances.

---

## PROGRAMME CONTENTS AND DESIGN

### Integration with Government Plans

14. The Pakistan Country Programme is consistent and well integrated with the development objectives of the Government of Pakistan as outlined in its Eighth Five-Year Plan (1993–98). It also reflects the priorities established by the donor community in Pakistan as presented in the Country Strategy Note. The Eighth Five-Year Plan accorded a high priority to the development of the social sector and the reduction of poverty. To achieve this goal, the Government adopted an ambitious Social Action Programme (SAP) to address the needs of the rural poor (particularly women and girls) in basic education, primary health, family planning and rural water supply and sanitation. A multi-donor consortium comprising the World Bank, Asian Development Bank (ADB), Department for International Development (DFID), the Netherlands and more recently the European Commission and Canada, has supported SAP. In addition, there is a Multi-Donor Support Unit which organizes a larger SAP consultative group that includes WFP, UNICEF, UNDP, UNFPA, WHO and a number of cash donors. The interventions supported under the Country Programme in fact constitute the most direct assistance provided to the beneficiaries in the social sector, since SAP support is primarily aimed at developing the institutional capacity of the Government, including the provision of



physical infrastructure. WFP operations in the social sector have been re-named as Support to the Social Action Programme (SSAP), indicating a closer integration with the SAP.

15. The interventions in NRM are also well integrated and consistent with the goals and objectives of the Government's National (and Provincial) Conservation Strategy and the Forestry Master Plan. The interventions are compatible with the reforms being undertaken in the forestry sector. WFP is a founding member of the Forestry Donors Coordination Group for NWFP, composed of representatives of Germany, the Netherlands, Switzerland, as well as of the AsDB, World Conservation Unit (IUCN), FAO, WFP and UNDP. The group has promoted a wide range of changes in the forestry sector, including support to the Government's own institutional reforms process with funding provided by the AsDB, the Netherlands, Switzerland, IUCN and UNDP.

### Linkages with Development Partners

16. The provision of food aid, whether directly or as an income transfer, as the sole vehicle for financing, limits the objectives of the interventions themselves. Therefore, achieving the full impact of the interventions requires action at a number of levels beyond that of food assistance alone. This implies the need to establish linkages with other development partners. The CP experience in this aspect is varied. In the social sectors, particularly in health, there is little association with other partners. As a consequence, the full impact of the interventions has not been achieved. The WFP objective of attracting women to health centres is complementary to the Government's objective of improving the services.
17. It is clear that sustained attendance will depend on the quality of the services provided. Yet, although the opportunities for improving service delivery exist through institutional support provided under SAP, no **explicit linkages** have been established to ensure that the various inputs are mutually supportive. **Project design must ensure that interventions are comprehensive** enough to have the desired impact. Consequently, it becomes imperative that **explicit linkages and partnerships be forged with other development agencies** in the same field to ensure a comprehensive coverage so as to achieve a sustainable impact. The objective of interventions in the education sector also suffered from a similar constraint, of being limited to WFP operations alone.
18. In contrast, the interventions in natural resource management have been complemented by a number of different and supportive actions beyond those provided by WFP. Explicit linkages have been established with a number of bilateral aid agencies (Australia, Canada, Germany, Italy and the Netherlands) and some NGOs as well as FAO/UNDP to provide additional co-financing and, what is more important, technical assistance. This complementary support from other partners has helped significantly in ensuring overall project impact. Although the partnerships have been dominated by a technical and forestry bias, and improvements are needed in the mix of interventions in resource management and in the exchange and coordination of information, it is clear that an approach based on partnerships with other agencies has contributed to greater impact on the situation of the targeted population in the project areas.

### Linkages between Sectoral Interventions

19. There is little evidence that linkages in planning or implementation within the sectoral activities have been sufficiently considered. Despite some area overlap in the two activities in the social sector as well as the existence of a SAP coordination committee at the provincial level, little effort was undertaken in this direction. The two interventions were implemented virtually independently of each other. Better coordination in the areas of





policy, logistics and monitoring would have made WFP's implementation work more efficient.

### **Integration within Institutional Environment**

20. The established modality of working with the Government has implied that both intervention categories are well integrated within the different line agencies of the Government: the Provincial Health Department, the Education Department and the Forest Department, respectively. Among the line departments, only in the case of forestry has there been any strengthening of institutional capability, by means of a reasonably large training programme. Very little institutional support has been provided to the line agencies in the social sectors. However, the need for greater impact implies that institutional arrangements should be developed with other partners, both within and outside the Government. This has been established to some extent in NRM interventions. As a result of the technical assistance provided, the Forestry Department has not only been able to adopt a social forestry and community development orientation, but has also established working-level contacts with a few NGOs and local-level village organizations that the interventions have helped to create. The involvement with this evolving structure helps considerably in programme implementation, impact and sustainability.
21. In contrast, the institutional infrastructure for interventions in the social sectors is limited almost entirely to the Government line agencies. In the case of the health sector, for instance, it is recognized that as the intervention is breaking new ground in the prevailing cultural norms, there is an acute need for an activist approach towards social mobilization. Increasing acceptance through a substantive awareness creation programme, community participation through village health committees, the involvement of the local community health workers (LHWs), village elders (both men and women), NGOs and mosque committees would contribute to a wider acceptance of project interventions. A number of these measures are re-defining the institutional environment at the local level, but little has yet been done to forge links with these evolving structures to achieve greater impact.
22. In the education sector, the sustained nature of the support provided under the project has had a significant positive impact on programme goals in terms of both increased enrolment and reduced absence of students and teachers. Nevertheless, a more comprehensive design of project interventions, by taking advantage of the SAP facility combined with a social mobilization programme and community participation, would have improved community ownership and overall sustainability. This has not been undertaken.

### **PEOPLE ORIENTATION: TARGETING, GENDER AND PARTICIPATORY PROCESSES**

23. In the absence of specific information on the location and profile of the poor, all the interventions under the CP have used geographic targeting based on the application of broad parameters. At a general level, this has understandably been a more practical approach. In the context of the social sector interventions, the identification of the backward districts on the basis of such parameters, particularly given the wide divergence between the national and district averages, was acceptable. However, this was not the case with respect to the NRM interventions. The selection of project areas was based on physical and environmental terms and the assumed correlation between the severity of environmental degradation and the poverty of the people. Implicit in the adoption of the



watershed management approach has been the creation of common property assets with the focus on the poor or landless as the primary beneficiaries. In actual fact, a good part of the benefits have accrued to people outside the target group.<sup>1</sup> The Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping (VAM) Unit, established in the WFP Regional Office in Islamabad, is now in a position to collect the data required for a more refined targeting.

24. Interventions in the social sector have been explicitly gender-driven, with a focus on women. As argued earlier, the condition of rural women provides a strong rationale for support under WFP's Gender Action Plan. Interventions in resource management have also made some attempts to direct activities towards women. In the context of the social environment, some progress has been made.
25. With respect to the adoption of a participatory process, the Country Programme provides a mixed picture. The lack of integration with the local institutional/social environment referred to earlier in the education and social sector activities reflects shortcomings with regard to participants' influence. In contrast, the NRM programme has been oriented towards the development of participatory processes. These have been implicit in the establishment and development of village/community-level organizations such as Village Development Committees (VDCs) and Women's Organizations or Groups. Such local-level institutions are still in a fledgling state of development, yet what is important is that a beginning has been made in the recognition of a need for participatory processes.

## IMPACT AND SUSTAINABILITY

26. The full impact from interventions in natural resource management will only become evident in the long term. There is, however, some evidence to indicate that, even in the short to medium term, benefits do accrue, such as access through tertiary roads and some progress with regard to the availability of grazing land and fuelwood supplies. But there are also indications of negative effects in some areas, such as loss of grazing land and rights to fuelwood collection. Similarly, while the full impact of improved school attendance rates will only be seen in the long term, evidence suggests that school enrolments have increased. This represents a first and crucial step towards realizing the longer-term benefits for girls. With respect to health, however, there is no consistent evidence that the project, as implemented, will have a sustained impact. Part of this may be attributed to the inadequate supply of oil to centres to meet even the entitlements of women who already attend. It is probably also due to the lack of involvement of the whole community (e.g. also men and older women) and the effects of such factors as distance from the centres, quality of services provided, etc.
27. The issue of sustainability in resource management measures is linked with that of **benefit distribution**. Some of the benefits from afforestation/social forestry measures will only accrue in the distant future (40–70 years). Since a major portion of the areas being planted are commonly accessible but remain private lands, there is no guarantee that the owners would not exercise their ownership rights once the trees reach maturity and their value becomes evident. Benefit sharing agreements between the land owners and the VDCs

<sup>1</sup> A study undertaken by the country office in 1996 found that in the NRM interventions, the Village Development Committees (VDCs) were dominated by landowners. Decisions taken by them were largely focused for their benefit, while others, such as the closure of project plantation sites, reduced access for the landless to fuelwood, fodder and grazing land. The WFP survey was carried out in villages receiving assistance in the seventies and the eighties and thus does not reflect the later move towards social forestry.



currently do not have any legal standing since the latter are not recognized as legally constituted bodies. There is a need for conferring a legal status to locally constituted organizations if sustainability in resource management measures is to be assured. A legal identity is required not only for assets becoming available in the distant future, such as trees, but also for benefits accruing in the shorter term and for the operation of any savings and loans schemes.

28. Provisional evidence in the education intervention indicates that progress made in enrolment and retention of students may, at least partly, be maintained also after the incentive has been withdrawn. Rural people, particularly mothers, have become more aware of the benefits of education and are thus likely to continue sending their daughters to school also without an incentive. In some cases this has even led to a demand for education for girls beyond the primary school level. At the same time, it is clear that sustainability of educational achievements made under the project, let alone progress towards more far-reaching objectives, such as full education for all girls, will depend on many factors outside WFP's scope. These would include, among others, improvements in the supply and quality of educational services, and the empowerment of women and girls in society.
29. The current structure of the health programme raises some concern about its sustainability. **There is a need to revisit the programme objective, scope, contents and operational modality.** Given that the indicators of child and maternal health in Pakistan are extremely poor—especially when compared to countries of similar levels of development—it would seem important that WFP continues its support to this sector. A key element promoting the sustainable use of health services is client satisfaction and not enough attention has been given to assuring the quality of the services before the incentives were provided. There is evidence that the inconsistent application of incentives has contributed negatively to women's opinion of the primary caregiver (i.e. the lady health visitor) and could even discourage long-term use of services. Also, the current mode does not address the need to raise women's and children's health issues to the level of community concerns, rather than women's problems. Nevertheless, it is commendable that WFP is providing support directly to women and children. Most of the assistance under SAP is at the institutional level.

## PROGRAMME IMPLEMENTATION

### Supply Delivery and Allocation Flexibility

30. Programme implementation was compromised by an erratic and reduced supply of both wheat and oil. While this was largely due to WFP's inability to resource and allocate adequate food quantities, delayed delivery also contributed to the shortfall. The impact of this reduced supply was somewhat compensated by using alternative sources, that is, from PRO activities related to the Afghan refugee operations. In the aggregate, there was less of a shortfall in both the annual and total supplies of oil for the social sectors than of wheat for the NRM sector. Flexibility in the use of resources would have been greater if the same commodity had been used for the whole programme. The use of two commodities, wheat and oil, compromised this advantage since a shortfall in one could not be compensated by a surplus in the other.
31. As a result of the reduced supply, programme implementation, particularly in the resource management and health sectors, was compromised. There is little doubt, however,



that the programme approach did allow WFP to respond in a rational manner to variations in the total availability of food aid. By allowing decisions to be taken closer to the scene of action, WFP was able to match allocation to performance.

32. Programme implementation in the health sector has been particularly poor because apart from the effect of the overall shortage of supply, there were shortcomings in design with more centres accepted than could be adequately supported with planned resources, even without an increase in attendance.

### **Operational Plans and Administrative Requirements**

33. With the introduction of the Country Programme, the detailed plans of operation for individual projects were replaced by agreements related to approved activities. Thus there were no comprehensive documents that spelled out the goals, implementation modalities and WFP/Government obligations with regard to the specific interventions. Resources allocated to WFP were subsequently apportioned to the sectors and provinces on the basis of annual work plans established in consultation with the different line agencies of the Government. The approach has provided the WFP office with more authority over the use of resources within the country. However, the Government, represented by the different line agencies of the Provincial Government, has not had that flexibility.
34. Counterpart funds are allocated through the Provincial Government's revenue budget or its Annual Development Plan through a pro-forma appraisal process called PC-1. Operating line agencies find it difficult to process annual PC-1s to reflect the variable annual WFP allocation. Discussions within the current WFP and Government line agencies management structure indicate the need for processing one of two alternatives, either a yearly "umbrella" PC-1 covering all provincial PC-1s (sectors), or a PC-1 for each sector for the whole five-year programme period. The current situation is confusing and covers the entire spectrum of annual, five-year, or—in the case of Punjab—no PC-1 approval. There is a critical need for a uniform approach with regard to counterpart fund allocations.

### **Institutional Relationships**

35. WFP's primary counterpart is the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock (MinFAL), whose interest and involvement in WFP's programmes is marginal. It is important for WFP to find an appropriate institutional berth within the Government. The structure, with the Federal Government only acting as a coordinating agency and the Provincial Governments playing a more important implementing role, implies that WFP, from the perspective of the Federal Government, is primarily a source of external assistance. It would consequently be more appropriate for WFP to have as a Government counterpart either the Economic Affairs Division (EAD) of the Ministry of Finance or the Planning Commission. This same recommendation was made in 1993 in an evaluation of WFP in Pakistan undertaken by the Chr. Michelson Institute, Norway, but the arrangement remains unchanged.
36. At the same time, WFP's working relationships with the Provincial Governments need to be strengthened. This implies not only establishing closer links with the implementing line agencies, but also with the Provincial Planning and Development (P&D) departments. That role should not be left to the provincial WFP offices. WFP Islamabad should establish direct and regular programming relationships with the P&D departments, effectively the equivalent of the EAD at the federal level.



## WFP PERFORMANCE

37. The adoption of the programme approach has implied a more important and active role for the country office, not only in managing the flow of food inputs and the inevitable problems in their scheduling and delivery, but also in ensuring that the overall objectives of the programme were maintained or modified, whenever changes in the policy environment made that necessary. Overall programme implementation, however, was less than satisfactory. Although labelled as a programme, the interventions were implemented almost as discrete projects. Apart from the resource perspective, implementation of the different elements of the programme was carried out independently and there was little qualitative change from WFP's own perspective as a consequence of the new approach.
38. To its credit, the country office effectively handled the delivery delays and shortfalls with regard to WFP resources, but its contribution towards resolving difficulties originating on the Government's side was insufficient. This arose principally because of a lack of contact at a sufficiently senior level between the country office and the Government. In addition, the expectation that benefit monitoring and impact assessments would provide mid-course corrections to programme interventions failed to materialize and the information generated from regular monitoring activities was not used to initiate any adjustments that may have been warranted.

## GOVERNMENT PERFORMANCE

39. As already discussed in the section on Institutional Relationships, MinFAL is the WFP counterpart for all activities, also those related to health and education. As the Ministry is not otherwise involved in these sectors, programme implementation has been affected, in particular with regard to staffing issues. Government counterpart contributions have also been delayed. Performance on this front has, however, varied across provinces. Although allocations in the social sector should be protected from reductions due to budgetary revisions according to the Government's policy guidelines, this has not been so in some cases. A recent directive from the Federal Government has confirmed that WFP-supported interventions are protected from such downward revisions in the same manner as the SAP supported programmes.

## CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

40. As the first in a series of efforts by WFP to move into a programme approach, the Pakistan Country Programme has achieved some efficiency in the allocation and utilization of resources. In the light of a varying overall resource availability, this was commendable. The components of the programme were also well integrated within Government plans and donor priorities. However, in terms of the programme's overall target orientation, impact and sustainability, the results have been variable. While the full impact of interventions in natural resource management will only become evident much later, also the short-term effects were not very clear. Despite some indications of increased availability of fuelwood, studies indicate that the interventions had been dominated by land owners. As a result, it is difficult to establish that benefits from the creation of common property assets would accrue to, and continue to benefit, the primary target group—the poor and landless. In contrast, while the full impact of improved attendance at schools will only be seen in the



long term, evidence indicates that school enrolments have increased. However, with respect to health, it is doubtful that there has been any sustained increase in levels of attendance at health centres. Thus, there is a need to reassess the health interventions in terms of programme objectives, scope, contents and operational modalities. Programme impact would have been better if efficient linkages with other development partners had been forged. This was particularly important for the social sector interventions. Implementation would also have been considerably improved if more active and direct relationships could have been established between WFP and the concerned line agencies in the Provincial Governments.

41. The first recommendations reflect those that have a bearing on the overall Country Programme and, therefore, relate to the sectoral interventions. The concluding recommendation focuses on aspects concerning the specific activities.
42. **Intervention Design and Partnerships.** Programme interventions need to be considered in a broader context, not necessarily limited to WFP's role alone. A pro-active effort is needed to establish partnerships with other donor agencies to support WFP operations. Efforts need to be made so that the appropriate overall impact from the interventions is achieved. Consequently, WFP has to ensure that interventions are more comprehensive in their objectives. There is a need to look, in the case of the social sectors, beyond the immediate objectives of attracting students to schools and women to health centres and consider also the improvement of the quality of the services provided.
43. **Community Participation.** There is need for greater **community involvement and participation.** This implies that programme interventions must include an advocacy campaign aiming at better integration with the local and evolving institutional environment. Thus, efforts should be undertaken, by WFP and the Government counterparts, to **inform and involve**, where available, village and district health committees, local mosque committees, parent-teacher associations, women's committees, etc.
44. **Targeting.** Geographic targeting should be refined to allow selection of district subdivisions or *tehsils* (administrative units). To support this, the VAM Unit of the country office must gather and maintain more precise information.
45. **Monitoring and Evaluation.** There is a need to monitor and analyse more closely progress towards objectives of project interventions. Relevant indicators have to be identified. Linkages with information collected by other agencies such as the Government Health Management Information System (HMIS) in the case of health and the Education Management Information System (EMIS) in education should be strengthened. WFP field monitoring should be further enhanced through recruitment of additional female staff, greater use of standardized checklists, and the identification of appropriate progress indicators.
46. **WFP Operational Relationships.** As a funding agency, WFP's counterpart at the national/federal level should be the Economic Affairs Division of the Ministry of Finance or the Planning Commission. The current linkage with the Ministry of Food, Agriculture and Livestock needs to be changed. Operational relationships (annual programming and review exercises) with the Provincial P&D Departments should be established. A close relationship with P&Ds would also allow the formulation of five-year PC-1s to secure the degree of flexibility in resource allocation that the programme approach implicitly requires.
47. **Phase-out conditions.** Given the limited capacity of WFP and the Government, and in order to avoid creating dependency, each intervention should be time-bound. Specific



targets need to be established, and withdrawal decisions should depend on the achievement of, or failure to demonstrate progress towards, stated objectives.



## ANNEX













**SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (NRM SECTOR)**

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual deliveries (tons)	Actual utilization (tons)	Beneficiaries (no)	Value in (million \$)	Government budget (million \$)	Non-food items	
							Item	Million \$
<b>Project 4659.00—Environmental Rehabilitation on Malakand division of NWFP (Swat, Buner, Chitral)</b>								
1994-95	2 300	0	200	6 030		0.04	Volvo trucks	0.047
1995-96	5 000	5 346.76	7 788.889	13 400	0.90	1.35	Computer	0.388
1996-97	9 000	4 520	5 085.391	9 122	0.76	0.97		
1997-98	8 400	13 145	2 600	2 950	2.21	0.54		
<b>Total</b>	<b>24 700</b>	<b>23 011.76</b>	<b>15 674.28</b>	<b>31 502</b>	<b>3.87</b>	<b>2.90</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>0.435</b>
<b>Project 2451.00—Assistance to Tarbela and Mangla Watersheds (Abbottabad, Mansehra, Kohistan, Haripur, Buner)</b>								
1994-95	10 400	7 500	376	2 230	1.26	0.07		
1995-96	10 000	9 656.24	8 081	13 570	1.62	1.29		
1996-97	10 000	5 100	7 915.58	14 222	0.86	1.39		
1997-98	10 200	14 900	6 000	13 913	2.50	1.16		
<b>Total</b>	<b>40 600</b>	<b>37 156.24</b>	<b>22 372.13</b>	<b>43 935</b>	<b>6.24</b>	<b>3.9</b>		

**SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (NRM SECTOR)**

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual deliveries (tons)	Actual utilization (tons)	Beneficiaries (no)	Value in (million \$)	Government budget (million \$)	Non-food items	
							Item	Million \$
<b>Project 4003.00—Rural Development in the North-Eastern Territory (Muzaffarabad, Poonch, Kotli, Mirpur, Bagh)</b>								
1994-95	1 900	0	1 104	1 472		0.28	Trucks Nissan pick-up	0.0455 0.047
1995-96	5 000		9 373	10 579		2.18	Hand drill machine	0.18736
1996-97	10 000		5 739	6 788		1.47	Equipment	0.10497
1997-98	11 984	17 604	5 567	9 093	2.96	1.57	Computer	0.00318
<b>Total</b>	<b>28 884</b>	<b>17 604</b>	<b>21 783</b>	<b>27 933</b>	<b>2.96</b>	<b>5.5</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>0.388</b>
<b>Project 2309.00—Rural Development Works in NWFP and the Federally Administered Tribal Areas (Kohat, Karak, Bannu, Lakki)</b>								
1994-95	17 845	0	0	0		0.00	Volvo trucks	0.1365
1995-96	5 000	0	902.22	2 100		0.11	Pick-ups	0.072
1996-97	8 000	0	517.39	850		0.07	Tractor + Tanker	0.02635
1997-98	7 000	9 338	750	1 500	1.57	0.11		
<b>Total</b>	<b>37 845</b>	<b>9 338</b>	<b>2 169.614</b>	<b>4 450</b>	<b>1.57</b>	<b>0.301</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>0.23485</b>
<b>Project 4377.00—Rural Development in Balochistan (Quetta, Pashin, Loralai, Q. Saifullah, Q. Abdullah, Musa Khel)</b>								
1994-95	2 500		610	813		0.24	Pick-ups	0.04777
1995-96	2 500		5 616.667	4 585		1.99		
1996-97	5 000		673.913	1 250		0.26		
1997-98	6 000	4 600	500	1 000	0.77	0.21		
<b>Total</b>	<b>16 000</b>	<b>4 600</b>	<b>7 400.58</b>	<b>7 648</b>	<b>0.77</b>	<b>2.7</b>	<b>Total</b>	<b>0.04777</b>

<b>SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (NRM SECTOR)</b>
---

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual deliveries (tons)	Actual utilization (tons)	Beneficiaries (no)	Value in (million \$)	Government budget (million \$)	Non-food items	
							Item	Million \$
<b>Project (PRO) 4256.00—The deliveries were transferred to NRM</b>								
1996-97	10 000	10 000	10 000	10 000	Transferred to NRM			
1997-98	11 500	11 530	11 530	11 530	Transferred to NRM			
<b>Total</b>	<b>21 500</b>	<b>21 530</b>	<b>21 530</b>	<b>21 530</b>				

**SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (NRM SECTOR)**

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual deliveries (tons)	Actual utilization (tons)	Beneficiaries (no)	Value (in million \$)	Government budget (million \$)	Non-food items	\$ per beneficiary
Total 1994-95	34 945	7 500	2 290	10 545	1.26	0.618	1.231	116.745
Total 1995-96	27 500	15 003	31 762	44 234	2.52	6.924	11.839	267.633
Total 1996-97	52 000	19 620	29 931	32 232	3.30	4.164	7.242	224.695
Total 1997-98	55 084	71 117	26 947	28 457	11.95	3.594	6.099	214.316
<b>Grand total</b>	<b>169 529</b>	<b>113 240</b>	<b>90 929</b>	<b>115 468</b>	<b>19.03</b>	<b>15.301</b>	<b>26.411</b>	<b>228.727</b>



**SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (SAP SECTOR)**

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual value of oil deliveries		Actual utilization (tons)	Actual beneficiaries (new cases) (no.)	Government budgets	Non-food items
		(tons)	US\$				
<b>Project 2237.03—Assistance to Primary Health Care</b>							
1994-95	1 935	1 544	1 698 400	500	n.a.	335 092	100 000
1995-96	3 565	3 051	3 356 100	1 700	n.a.	352 642	
1996-97	4 500	1 679	1 846 900	2 300	n.a.	306 068	
1997-98	4 500	3 073	3 380 300	2 450	n.a.	272 768	
1998-99	4 500	2 500	2 750 000	2 500	n.a.	271 061	
<b>Total</b>	<b>19 000</b>	<b>11 847</b>	<b>13 031 700</b>	<b>9 450</b>	<b>—</b>	<b>1 537 631</b>	<b>100 000</b>

**SUMMARY OF WFP DELIVERIES, UTILIZATION, BENEFICIARIES AND COUNTERPART FUNDING (SAP SECTOR)**

Year	Planned deliveries (tons)	Actual value of oil deliveries		Actual utilization (tons)	Incremental beneficiaries* (school girls/teachers)	Government budgets	Non-food items
		(tons)	US\$				
<b>Project 4185.00—Promotion of Primary Education for Girls</b>							
1994-95	683	662	728 200	275	12 000	26 227	330 000
1995-96	662	592	651 200	608	7 500	60 675	
1996-97	1 600	1 044	1 148 400	1 017	11 000	77 141	
1997-98	1 672	1 050	1 155 000	900	10 800	81 585	
1998-99	1 810	1 500	1 650 000	1 100	12 000	107 959	
<b>Total</b>	<b>6 427</b>	<b>4 848</b>	<b>5 332 800</b>	<b>3 900</b>	<b>53 300</b>	<b>353 587</b>	<b>330 000</b>

\* Numbers of beneficiaries are notional estimates.

