

برنامج
الأغذية
العالمي



Programme
Alimentaire
Mondial

World
Food
Programme

Programa
Mundial
de Alimentos

**Executive Board
First Regular Session**

Rome, 13 - 16 February 2001

EVALUATION REPORTS

Agenda item 6

For consideration



Distribution: GENERAL
WFP/EB.1/2001/6/2
22 December 2000
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

SUMMARY REPORT OF THE MID-TERM EVALUATION¹ OF COUNTRY PROGRAMME FOR YEMEN (1998–2001)

¹ The mission was composed of two international consultants and one national consultant. An OEDE Evaluation Officer joined the mission on 25 April 2000.

Note to the Executive Board



This document is submitted for consideration to the Executive Board.

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document, to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, Office of Evaluation (OEDE): Mr A. Wilkinson tel.: 066513-2029

Evaluation Officer, OEDE: Ms M. Ahmed tel.: 066513-2223

Should you have any questions regarding matters of dispatch of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact the Supervisor, Meeting Servicing and Distribution Unit (tel.: 066513-2328).



Executive Summary



The Yemen Country Programme (CP) with its strategic focus on poverty and food insecurity, its concentration on social-sector activities in education and health, and its strong emphasis on gender equality, supports explicit Government development policies and priorities. In essence, the CP largely consists of two major programme components (education and health). Both components pursue the broad objectives of WFP policies and strategies. Food aid, by acting as an incentive for girls and women to make use of education and health services, helps to alleviate existing key constraints to human development and to build human capacities. Moreover, as an in-kind income transfer to poor rural households, food contributes directly to the alleviation of poverty and improvement of access to food. The introduction of the country programme approach in Yemen has not yet brought about any substantive changes as the design and implementation of WFP's assistance has largely continued to follow the lines of the individual project approach as practised before. This may be attributable to an earlier lack of clear guidelines on making the CP approach operational. Nevertheless, certain elements of a country programme approach can be found. For example, the two activities follow the same broad objectives of WFP's core policies and strategies, and they concentrate on social-sector development in the same geographical areas.

The Yemen CP is compliant with the Enabling Development policy. Although implementation is satisfactory, with all projects on schedule as regards achievements made, some improvements would be needed. These include refining the system of area targeting, and strengthening food aid management, monitoring and reporting techniques.

With respect to the forthcoming CP, the major thrust on social-sector activities should be maintained but arrangements should be made to make better use of the potential benefits of a substantive country programme approach. This will particularly require closer coordination and cooperation with the Government as well as with other United Nations and donor agencies, in programme and activity planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation.

Draft Decision



The Board notes the recommendations contained in this evaluation report (WFP/EB.1/2001/6/2) and notes also the management action taken so far, as indicated in the associated information paper (WFP/EB.1/2001/INF/11). The Board encourages further action on these recommendations taking into account considerations raised during the discussion.



PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION AND METHODOLOGY USED

1. Since the Yemen Country Programme (CP) terminates in 2001, a mid-term evaluation was commissioned by the Office of Evaluation (OEDE) in order to assess the CP as to the coherence, focus, integration and flexibility of the programme approach applied. Also examined were the significance and validity of programme objectives and achievements; critical factors that have affected programme implementation positively or negatively; and key issues of WFP assistance, such as targeting, food security, gender, creation of sustainable assets, coordination with the Government, and cooperation and joint programming with other United Nations and development agencies in the country. Furthermore, recommendations for the formulation of the second-generation Country Strategy Outline (CSO) and CP were to be made.
2. After initial briefings and document review at WFP headquarters, the mission was fielded in Yemen from 12 April to 3 May 2000. During the field study, relevant documents were reviewed and meetings held with the Director and staff of the WFP country office, representatives of relevant government ministries and organizations, Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation (MAI), Ministry of Planning and Development (MOPD), Ministry of Public Health (MOPH), Ministry of Education (MOE), Central Statistical Organization, United Nations Organizations (FAO, UNDP, United Nations Population Fund (UNFPA), UNICEF), World Bank, the European Community, donors and NGOs. The mission visited a number of assisted and non-assisted schools and health centres in Hadramout and Mahweet governorates, as well as the site of the agricultural pilot scheme in Mahweet. Interviews were held with representatives of government departments at the governorate and district levels, school headmasters, health centre staff and beneficiaries. On 30 April, the preliminary findings, conclusions and recommendations of the evaluation were presented and discussed in a one-day workshop in Sana'a, attended by about 40 participants representing various government departments, United Nations and other organizations. The feedback from the workshop was incorporated into the full mission report.
3. Prior to the CP evaluation, mid-term management reviews of the two projects currently under implementation (education and health) were undertaken by the country office. Their results have been duly considered for the purpose of this evaluation.

THE COUNTRY PROGRAMME AS PLANNED

4. The Yemen CP (1998–2001), based on the CSO of 1996, was approved by the Executive Board in 1997. The CP defines the strategy of WFP assistance over a four-year period, focusing on issues of food insecurity and the hungry poor, with the overall goals of improving the nutritional status of the most vulnerable people at critical times of their lives, helping to build assets and promoting the self-reliance of poor people and communities. The objectives of the CP are identical with those of the individual planned activities and are as follows:
 - a) reduce the gender gap in education by providing incentives for girls to attend school, concurrently targeting food to the poorest groups through the selection of schools;
 - b) encourage women, children and those with contagious diseases to use adequately equipped primary health care services (targeting the poorest areas, through the



- selection of governorates and health centres, where relevant government and other external assistance improves the delivery of health services);
- c) help improve the immediate food security of the poorest groups and, with their participation, invest in activities for sustainable food security;
 - d) ensure the food security of refugees living in camps; and
 - e) reduce the incidence of micronutrient deficiencies by providing fortified basic food commodities.
5. The CP provides for a core allocation of 74,316 tons of food aid, valued at US\$28.5 million, for basic activities, as well as supplementary activities valued at US\$8.8 million. The CP identifies four core development activities (Support to Basic Education, Support through Health Centres, Local Initiatives in Support of Household Food Security, and Women's Health and Micronutrient Facility), and two supplementary activities (expansion of basic activities in the sectors of health and agriculture). About two thirds of the planned WFP resources under the CP were allocated to the education component.
 6. Although the protracted relief and recovery operation (PRRO) for Somali refugees in Yemen was originally planned to address objective d) of the CP, it is funded and implemented as a separate project outside the CP.
 7. Up to now, only the first two activities (education and health) have become operational. The Women's Health and Micronutrient Facility activity has not been implemented, mainly due to unresolved legal and technical issues. Nevertheless, wheat flour and oil provided as food aid for all projects are generally fortified with vitamin A.

ASSESSMENT AND CONCLUSIONS

Concept and Design

📌 **Country Programme Approach**

8. The first-generation CP for Yemen constitutes a change in label rather than in substance. The design and implementation of the existing "Country Programme" largely follow the concept of individual project approaches as practised before, and the specific features of a programme approach are only partly reflected. For example, the stated objectives of the CP are merely a listing of the objectives of the individual programme activities. Again, provision has not been made for the establishment of an appropriate structure, such as a Country Food Advisory Committee (CFAC), which provides a forum for coordination in the implementation and monitoring of programme activities. The two WFP sub-offices of Hodeidah and Taiz were originally established as logistics offices in 1998, and the monitoring of development activities was added to their responsibilities only this year. The Aden sub-office is primarily responsible for monitoring the PRRO, but starting this year it will also take responsibility for monitoring development activities. The CP has not led to an integrated country-wide approach to the management of resources, logistics and monitoring. In addition, there is no country programme agreement between the Government and WFP. It should be noted that the plans of operations for the health and education activities, which constitute the only formal basis of WFP's operations under the current CP, only make minor references to the programme approach. Moreover, those



plans of operations do not bring the specific features of the CP approach to the attention of the government authorities—WFP's major implementing partners.

9. The fact that in Yemen the CP approach has been applied only in a rudimentarily fashion may be attributable to the earlier lack of clear guidelines on making the CP approach operational. Nevertheless, certain elements of a country programming approach can be found, such as:
 - The activities follow the same broad objectives of WFP's core policies and strategies.
 - The activities concentrate on development of the social sector.
 - The activities concentrate on the same geographical areas of intervention.
 - The implementation periods of the activities are harmonized, allowing coordination in needs assessment, appraisals, operation and monitoring.
 - The programming cycles of UNDP, WFP and UNFPA have been harmonized, with UNICEF to join in 2001.

📌 *Role of WFP Food Aid*

10. Poverty and food insecurity have been identified as major constraints to human and overall development in Yemen. Yemen is both a least developed (LDC) and a low-income, food-deficit country (LIFDC), ranking 148 out of 174 countries in the 1999 Human Development Index (UNDP). Per capita gross national product (GNP) has fallen dramatically from US\$686 in 1990 to US\$270 in 1997, mainly because of diminished remittances from abroad resulting from the Gulf War of 1990. An estimated 21 percent of the population lives in poverty. Poverty is particularly concentrated in rural areas. Access to education is limited; the adult illiteracy rate stands at 57.5 percent (36 percent for men and 79 percent for women; in rural areas, the corresponding figures are 35 percent and 85 percent). Only 16 percent of the population has access to health care services. Extremely high malnutrition, infant mortality rates, and low birth weight indicate serious chronic food deficits among Yemen's population of about 17 million. It is estimated that some 1.7 million women and children are affected by malnutrition. In 1997, 45 percent of children under 5 were stunted, 16 percent were wasted, and 19 percent of new-borns had a low birth weight. Infant mortality is estimated at 76 per 1,000 live births, under-5 mortality rate is 100 per 1,000; maternal mortality rate stands at 1,400 per 100,000 childbirths, a figure significantly above the average LDC rate of 1,100. Factors such as the rapid yearly population growth of 3.9 percent, a fertility rate of 7.6 children per woman and low average per capita income exacerbate food insecurity.
11. WFP food aid provided under the current CP serves multiple purposes which directly and indirectly address the problems and causes of poverty and food insecurity:
 - By focusing on the rural poor, and particularly the female population, it addresses the needs of vulnerable population groups at critical times of their lives.
 - By acting as an incentive for girls and women to attend education and health services, it helps to alleviate existing key constraints to human development and to build human capacities on a sustainable basis.
 - As an income transfer in kind to poor rural households, it directly contributes to alleviating poverty and improving access to food.
12. Until recently, a general wheat and wheat flour subsidy was a major element of the Government's strategy to combat poverty and food insecurity. Because of the high budgetary costs involved and the limited effectiveness in reaching the poor and vulnerable,



general subsidies have been gradually phased out. Some of the negative effects of the reduced subsidies on the poor and vulnerable are being mitigated by the World Bank-supported “Social Fund for Development Project” and other poverty alleviation programmes. With the elimination of the subsidies, WFP food assistance has become an even more valuable resource for the beneficiaries.

13. In summary, food assistance plays a significant and effective role not only as an incentive to achieve the desired results, but also as a supplement to poor households’ food baskets.

✧ *Integration within Government Priorities*

14. The CP activities have addressed Government policies as laid down in the First Five-Year Development Plan (1996–2000), in poverty eradication and sector reform programmes, as well as in the recently adopted "Food Security Strategy". These particularly aim at alleviating the root causes of poverty and food insecurity and give high priority to basic education, primary health care and agricultural development.

✧ *Integration with United Nations Common Country Assessment (CCA) and Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF)*

15. The United Nations Development Assistance Framework (UNDAF) process has been initiated in Yemen. So far, a Common Country Assessment (CCA) and other studies have been prepared in which the activities under the current WFP Country Programme are considered. Actual and potential areas of coordination and cooperation among United Nations agencies have been identified. WFP should ensure that the next CP will be substantially integrated into UNDAF.

✧ *Targeting*

16. Both the education and health activities are concentrated in ten governorates.¹ Although the governorates are said to be selected on the basis of poverty prevalence (geographic targeting), the selection criteria actually applied are unknown or have remained unclear. According to recent poverty data (which were not available at the time the CSO and the CP documents were prepared), some of the governorates covered under the current CP would not qualify, whereas others qualifying according to poverty prevalence have not been included.
17. Selection criteria for schools and health centres within governorates have been defined. However, these criteria have hardly been applied. For example, poverty indicators have not been used, or could not be used due to the lack of poverty data at the district and sub-district levels. The criteria for school selection, as stated in the plan of operations and project summary, included gender gap in enrolment rates at the district level and priority given to rural areas, as well as poverty indicators in case of inconclusive outcomes. However, the gender gap criterion has not been applied, thus compromising the targeting efficiency. As to the health component, the selection criteria included the condition that a health centre to be assisted must have a functioning mother and child health (MCH) facility. This condition, and the fact that health centres with a functioning MCH facility are usually located in district towns, limits the outreach to poor women living in remote rural areas.

¹ Dhamar, Mahweet, Hajja, Hodeidah, Taiz, Abyan, Lahej, Shebwa, Hadramout and Sana’a.



18. In summary, the mission identified the following critical issues concerning targeting and selection:
- Governorates have not been selected on the basis of clear and transparent criteria.
 - Poverty indicators have not been used for the selection.
 - The selection criteria defined are not specific enough.

📌 *Gender Focus*

19. Gender has been integrated into the CP and in the project design. Both projects specifically target women and girls: women constitute 87 percent of beneficiaries of the health activity and 84 percent of the education activity.² Through the activities, women and girls contribute substantially to the household's food needs, thus strengthening their position. However, beyond their role as beneficiaries, little progress has been made with respect to women's participation in decision-making and control of resources as postulated by WFP's Commitments to Women.
20. For example, in the education project, there is no female project coordinator at any level—central, governorate, or district. The food committees typically consist of the headmaster, one or more male teachers, in some cases the storekeeper, and one or two fathers. There is almost never any female member, not even in schools that have many female teachers, or in General Authority for Scientific Institutions (GASI) schools where most of the teachers may be female. In these schools, female teachers were involved not in decision-making, but in clerical work such as preparing record sheets. The untapped potential of female committee members needs to be explored, particularly in schools where there are female teachers.
21. However, good progress has been made in the health project. One out of the ten project representatives at the governorate level is a woman; four out of 37 health centres are headed by women, and all MCH services at the 37 centres are headed by women. At the health centre level, midwives are implementing the project and selecting beneficiaries.

OPERATIONS AND IMPLEMENTATION

Education Activity

22. WFP primary school assistance reaches 62,800 girls in 600 primary schools of the ten governorates;³ 443 schools with 53,390 beneficiaries are managed by MOE, the remaining schools by GASI.⁴ In addition, boarding schools with a total of 12,000 students (only boys) are supported.
23. The education activity has produced the following results:

² The remaining beneficiaries are male tuberculosis and leprosy patients and boys in boarding schools.

³ The records are based on planning figures and not actual figures; see paragraph on monitoring.

⁴ NGO related to an Islamic party running public schools under the supervision of MOE.



- Increased enrolment of girls; assisted schools have recorded increases of 26 to 100 percent, whereas non-assisted schools show an increase of 12 percent.⁵
 - Reduced drop-out rates.
 - Reduced absenteeism.
 - A more positive general attitude towards girls' education.
24. Although some of the increases in enrolment rates may stem from a shift of students from non-assisted to assisted schools, as was suspected by the mid-term evaluation team, there was no evidence that such shifts have been of a significant size. The evidence obtained suggests that the education activity has performed well in achieving its objective, as well as the CP objective, to encourage the enrolment of girls in primary school. As a matter of fact, increases in enrolment have been higher than expected and planned.
25. The objectives of the programme to increase girls' enrolment and reduce drop-out rates require that girls enrol in grade 1 and continue, which means that a school, once selected, must remain in the programme. In some governorates, there has been a process of frequent re-selection of schools on an arbitrary basis. Previously assisted schools were excluded from assistance and other schools included. This practice is counterproductive to the programme's objectives. Furthermore, because of deficiencies and delays in reporting, management deficiencies or other reasons, some schools have received an insufficient quantity of food to meet their actual requirements. Due to the absence of suitable guidelines, schools have applied different practices to cope with such shortfalls, e.g. by distributing food rations to students of selected grades only, or by providing reduced rations to all female students.
26. Such practices make monitoring of programme implementation and achievements virtually impossible. In general, project implementation seems to be more concerned with food distribution as an isolated objective rather than an achievement of programme objectives. This points to a lack of appreciation of programme objectives by the concerned authorities. Monitoring and reporting both by MOE and the WFP country office is weak, irregular and, altogether, severely deficient. There are no monitoring plans.

Health Activity

27. Currently the health activity is implemented in 37 health centres, six tuberculosis centres and six leprosy centres in the ten governorates. During the initial phase of implementation, the number of beneficiaries at the health centres remained significantly below planning figures (45.9 percent of plan of operations figures and 69.2 percent of downward-revised planning figures). However, recent data show an increase in the utilization of MCH services and WFP food assistance.
28. Several factors have contributed to the slow start of this programme component:
- Change of selection criteria from malnourished children under 5 to those under 3 only.
 - Use of different growth monitoring charts in different health centres and the unavailability of such charts in other centres.
 - Very low cut-off point of 44 kg for expectant mothers to become eligible.

⁵ Based on data obtained at schools visited during field missions; data are not statistically representative for the country.



- Irregular flow of food commodities, disrupting regular monthly distribution to beneficiaries.
29. The delays in arrivals and depletion of stocks have led to accelerated or retroactive distributions. This has affected programme performance negatively in various respects: numbers of visits to health centres were reduced, mothers and their children did not receive their monthly rations, and new eligible beneficiaries could not be enrolled.
30. However, country programme performance was positively affected in those centres, which had received additional support from other agencies. Such centres are better equipped, staffed and have a well organized system of work.
31. Monitoring of the health activity is considered satisfactory. This is partly due to the fact that only 50 centres with easy access in district towns need to be monitored. Secondly, the implementing Ministry of Public Health (MOPH) takes active interest in monitoring.

Agricultural/Household Food Security Activity

32. The activity was planned as a pilot project to be implemented in four governorates. Project start has been seriously delayed and project activities are ready to start in one governorate only (Mahweet). Here, preparatory work has been carried out, such as community organization, formation of Community Management Committees (CMCs) and identification of project proposals, using participatory rural appraisal (PRA) techniques.
33. Various factors have contributed to the delay:
- Project design was highly complex and ambitious.
 - There were deficiencies and inconsistencies in project planning concerning procedures, tasks and responsibilities.
 - The time frame was over-ambitious and unrealistic.
 - FAO technical assistance did not come forward as promised and planned.
 - Funds and technical manpower capacities for project implementation were insufficient.
34. Community members, who have seen many appraisal and study missions for project preparation but no tangible project activities, have expressed their disappointment and frustration over this state of affairs.

Partnerships and Collaboration with Other Agencies

35. Food aid provided by WFP can never stand alone; in order to be effective, it requires complementary inputs from other partners. In both major programme components, such resources are provided by the Government in the form of education and health infrastructure, and management capacities. However, experience in implementing the CP, particularly in the health component, has shown better performance in cases where different agencies combine their specific and complementary resources and capacities, yielding synergic effects. For example, the present collaboration with the community health project supported by the Netherlands, and the *Radda Barnen* (Swedish Save the Children) project has helped in establishing a well organized system of work, equipment, and staff capacity-building. Performance at those health centres is clearly higher compared with other centres where such cooperation and complementary assistance are not in place.
36. The Government is committed to addressing the underlying causes of poverty and to alleviating its effects through several nation-wide programmes. Such programmes receive



substantial support from United Nations organizations and other donors, and WFP's assistance is acknowledged as a contribution in this regard. Efforts are under way to consolidate all poverty alleviation activities into a National Action Plan for Poverty Eradication (NAPPE). However, in spite of such efforts, the contributions from different sources have, up to now, largely remained individual donor-specific approaches, and few practical steps have been taken towards systematically combining efforts, capacities and complementary resources for more effectively achieving the common programme objectives.

37. Nevertheless, the potential for fruitful partnerships and collaboration should be fully explored. Such collaboration can either take the form of WFP attracting resources and capacities from third parties, or WFP contributing its food aid resources to the projects and programmes of other agencies.

Monitoring

38. The CP document does not identify any monitoring or reporting requirements. Reporting at the project level by implementing government authorities is generally late and incomplete; the reports, if provided at all, often repeat planning figures only, irrespective of actual achievements and real figures of food distribution to beneficiaries. Field monitoring by WFP takes place on an ad hoc basis without a monitoring plan. In addition, it is particularly weak in the education sector for various reasons, such as limited staff and transport capacities, and the fact that the schools to be covered are many and dispersed throughout the country. Project monitoring by the WFP country office is severely hampered by the delayed and incomplete reporting by implementation partners.
39. Although outcome indicators at the project level (e.g. enrolment rates of girls, health and nutritional status of mothers and children) are well defined and the data required are usually recorded at the schools and health centres, these data are not systematically collected, compiled, processed and transmitted to the concerned ministries. Consequently, no proper overall assessment is possible.

Food Aid Management

40. Erratic deliveries lead to accelerated or delayed food distribution, which significantly reduces the effectiveness of programme implementation (disincentive to regular attendance of schools and health centres, reduced nutritional impacts).
41. Mid-term project reviews that preceded the CP evaluation identified a number of deficiencies in food aid management, logistics and recording. Problems were recorded with contractors of secondary transport operations. For example, in some cases food was not delivered to the distribution sites. Sometimes contractors asked recipients (schools) to cover transport costs, although they had been covered under WFP's internal transport, storage and handling (ITSH) contribution and paid to the ministries. The country office was never invited to participate in the tender committees awarding the transportation contracts, nor has the country office invited the Government to sit on WFP committees, although this is stipulated in the plans of operations. Such deficiencies have resulted in significant leakages and losses, and have affected the efficiency and effectiveness of WFP's operations in the country.



COMPATIBILITY WITH WFP'S ENABLING DEVELOPMENT POLICY

42. The CP addresses two of the objectives of WFP's Enabling Development policy directly, namely: "enabling young children and expectant and nursing mothers to meet their special nutritional needs" through the health activity; and "enabling poor households to invest in human capital through education and training" through the education activity. The education activity also indirectly addresses the third objective of "making it possible for poor families to gain and preserve assets", since girls who do not drop out of school and continue with their education are more likely to participate in the labour force, engage in income-earning activities, and acquire more assets. In both activities, the role of food aid is to provide an incentive for participation. However, food assistance to boarding schools essentially represents institutional and budgetary support, and the latter is not considered compatible with the Enabling Development policy.
43. The planned agricultural activity is compatible with two objectives, by aiming to "enable poor rural families to gain and preserve physical assets" and "improve their conditions towards more sustainable livelihoods".

RECOMMENDATIONS

On the Country Programme Approach:

44. The awareness of the functions and benefits of a country programme should be raised among all parties concerned (WFP country office staff, host government, other partners), and the principles of a country programme approach should systematically be applied in planning, implementation, monitoring and evaluation. To this end, the recently issued operational procedures and guidelines for the country programme approach need to be further developed and put into practice. The respective training needs should be taken into account.
45. The scope offered by the CP approach should be further explored. This particularly refers to joint programming, monitoring and evaluation, flexibility in resource management, and the establishment of Food Aid Advisory/Coordinating Committees or similar consultative mechanisms. Such committees should involve all relevant stakeholders and address cross-cutting issues of food aid operations.
46. In order to make more effective use of the synergic effects of complementary resources and capacities provided by different donors, WFP should preferably seek to link its food aid assistance under the CP as a complementary input to assistance programmes of other United Nations agencies, donors and NGOs. The forthcoming UNDAF provides a suitable framework for such an approach.
47. A logical framework planning method should be applied in country programming, so as to ensure programme consistency.

On Targeting:

48. In order to ensure that food aid reaches the poorest and most food-insecure population groups, the system of area targeting needs be refined, using disaggregated (district, sub-district) data on poverty prevalence, when such data become available through Central



Statistical Organization/UNDP Poverty Information and Monitoring System (PIMS) and vulnerability analysis and mapping (VAM). The targeting criteria for selecting geographic areas and beneficiary groups should be precise, well understood by all parties involved, and strictly applied. With support of the WFP regional VAM officer, a VAM system should be established which allows targeting at the district and sub-district levels as well as the identification of particular vulnerable groups. For the establishment of the VAM system, WFP should ensure close cooperation with other agencies concerned with poverty assessment such as the World Bank, Central Statistical Organization and UNDP-PIMS.

On Gender:

49. Efforts should be made to increase women's participation in decision-making processes concerning implementation of activities at the central, governorate, and district levels, e.g. by recruiting more women in professional and management positions.
50. Women's participation in all project-related committees should be ensured. The food committees at the school level should have female members if there are female teachers. Also, mothers of school girls, preferably in groups, should be represented in such committees. Health and/or food committees in health centres should always have female members.

On Community Participation:

51. Although the nature of the present programme activities, being organized through Government authorities, offers limited scope for community participation in planning and implementation, the existing possibilities should be fully explored. This refers particularly to the envisaged food-for-work component in both activities, as well as to the involvement of community members in organizing and monitoring food distribution. Given the evidence of active community interest in all programme activities, food for work for community-based improvements, particularly those benefiting women, should be explicitly promoted.

On Implementation of the Education Activity:

52. In order to make implementation of the education component more effective and efficient, a cluster approach is recommended. This will minimize a shift of students from non-assisted to assisted schools and facilitate food management and monitoring. The selection of schools for assistance should be made carefully, based on clear criteria, and—once selected—schools must remain in the programme for its duration.
53. Provision should be made to adapt food aid deliveries to actual enrolments and to food requirements resulting from increased enrolment rates. CPs should make provision for such adjustments and flexibility. In future, such flexibility should be built into the CP document and agreement. In order to permit adjustments of food deliveries to changing requirements, quick reporting of actual enrolment figures is an absolute precondition (see recommendation on monitoring and reporting below).
54. Since food assistance to boarding schools constitutes institutional feeding and budgetary support, it is recommended to phase out such assistance in favour of increased support to girls' basic education.

On Implementation of the Health Activity:

55. WFP should further seek and intensify collaboration with other agencies in its health activities. WFP should consider the recommendations made by the mid-term review of the



health component, such as expansion of enrolment criteria for malnourished children and expectant mothers, establishment of women beneficiaries' committees at health centres and health education.

On Implementation of the Agricultural/Household Food Security Activity:

56. Taking into consideration the efforts already made, activities should be implemented, without further delay, in Mahweet governorate, but confined to the implementation of feasible and simple community projects. The implementation should be closely monitored in order to draw lessons for any future interventions of this type. Before any further expansion into other areas is considered, the project concept needs to be reviewed in order to make it simple and feasible, e.g. closed-circuit monetization to be replaced by community food-for-work arrangements, complementary funding sources to be mobilized (Social Development Fund, other donors, NGOs), technical assistance to be ensured, and community mobilization and organization to be action-oriented by implementing simple and minor schemes at the community level.

On Partnership and Cooperation:

57. New modalities of partnership, such as tripartite agreements, between WFP, United Nations and other organizations should be explored and tried. In order to increase the outreach, effectiveness and efficiency of food assistance programmes, efforts should be made to mobilize complementary non-food resources, e.g. through common programming and joint funding arrangements. Partnerships with NGOs and community-based organizations (CBOs) should be further explored, especially with regard to activities in community mobilization and organization. This may become particularly relevant for activities in agriculture and health. Any partnership arrangement should clearly specify the tasks and rights of each partner in memoranda of understanding or formal agreements.
58. The experience of the pilot project in agriculture/household food security leads to the conclusion that WFP should also explore the possibility of integrating its food assistance as a complementary input for assistance programmes of other agencies, such as the present collaboration with the Dutch-supported community health project, and the *Radda Barnen*-supported project, rather than designing its "own" projects for which various complementary inputs and capacities have to be mobilized from other sources.

On Monitoring, Reporting and Evaluation:

59. A regular and effective monitoring system should be established, and a monitoring system should be introduced under the next CP. Respective training requirements are to be taken into account. Reporting should be introduced at the CP level. Major efforts should be made to overcome existing shortcomings in terms of timeliness, quality and content of reporting at the project level. For example, reports on food distribution should be up to date and refer to actual performance figures.

On Food Aid Management:

60. Efforts should be made to match actual food delivery schedules with programme requirements, in order to avoid erratic, delayed or accelerated distributions.
61. The participation of the country office in the Government's tender committees for awarding contracts for secondary transport, and vice versa should be strictly adhered to as stipulated in the plan of operations.



62. In order to improve the efficiency and effectiveness of food aid management it is strongly recommended to review the present logistical arrangements. The country office should play a stronger role in food aid management. In this context, the country office may also consider assuming direct responsibility for secondary transport as foreseen in the CP document. In any case, a rigorous monitoring system should be enforced without delay.

FUTURE SCOPE OF THE COUNTRY PROGRAMME

63. For the new CP, it is recommended to continue to concentrate WFP assistance on the two social sectors of education and health, taking appropriate steps to bring about necessary improvements in targeting, food aid management, monitoring and reporting. Particular emphasis should be placed on intensifying coordination and cooperation arrangements with other United Nations organizations under the forthcoming UNDAF as well as with other donor agencies. Possible future activities in agriculture/household food security should be restricted to approaches that fulfil the following criteria: feasibility (based on evaluation of pilot schemes); simple project design; women-centred; community food-for-work arrangements; ensured provision of technical assistance and complementary non-food inputs from other partners (United Nations and donor agencies, NGOs).



ACRONYMS USED IN THE DOCUMENT

CBO	Community-based Organization
CCA	Common Country Assessment
CFAC	Country Food Advisory Committee
CMC	Community Management Committee
CP	Country Programme
CSO	Country Strategy Outline
EDP	Extended Delivery Point (warehouses for secondary food transport)
EFARP	Economic, Financial and Administrative Reform Programme
GASI	General Authority for Scientific Institutions
GNP	Gross national product
ITSH	Internal transport, storage and handling
LDC	Least developed country
LIFDC	Low-income, food-deficit country
MAI	Ministry of Agriculture and Irrigation
MCH	Mother and child health
MOE	Ministry of Education
MOPD	Ministry of Planning and Development
MOPH	Ministry of Public Health
NAPPE	National Action Plan for Poverty Eradication
OEDE	Office of Evaluation
PIMS	Poverty Information and Monitoring System
PRA	Participatory Rural Appraisal
PRRO	Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation
UNDAF	United Nations Development Assistance Framework
UNFPA	United Nations Population Fund
VAM	Vulnerability Analysis and Mapping

