

برنامج
الأغذية
العالمي



Programme
Alimentaire
Mondial

World
Food
Programme

Programa
Mundial
de Alimentos

**Executive Board
Annual Session**

Rome, 3–6 June 2014

EVALUATION REPORTS

Agenda item 7

*For information**

E

Distribution: GENERAL
WFP/EB.A/2014/7-E
24 April 2014
ORIGINAL: ENGLISH

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF EVALUATION RECOMMENDATIONS



* In accordance with the Executive Board's decisions on governance, approved at the Annual and Third Regular Sessions, 2000, items for information should not be discussed unless a Board member specifically requests it, well in advance of the meeting, and the Chair accepts the request on the grounds that it is a proper use of the Board's time.

This document is printed in a limited number of copies. Executive Board documents are available on WFP's Website (<http://executiveboard.wfp.org>).

NOTE TO THE EXECUTIVE BOARD

This document is submitted to the Executive Board for information.

The Secretariat invites members of the Board who may have questions of a technical nature with regard to this document to contact the WFP staff focal points indicated below, preferably well in advance of the Board's meeting.

Director, RMP*:	Mr C. Kaye	tel.: 066513-2197
Programme Advisor, RMP	Mr C. Martino	tel.: 066513-3576

Should you have any questions regarding availability of documentation for the Executive Board, please contact the Conference Servicing Unit (tel.: 066513-2645).

* Performance Management and Monitoring Division

INTRODUCTION

1. This is the fifth annual report on the implementation status of actions taken by all WFP offices in response to evaluation recommendations. It covers recommendations from evaluations presented to the Board from 2008 to the end of 2013.
2. The report has five sections: i) a brief description of the method; ii) an overview of relevant evaluation reports, recommendations and management actions; iii) an overview of the quantity and geographical distribution of recommendations; iv) analysis of implementation status, by evaluation type and region; and v) a summary and conclusions.

METHOD

3. The Performance Management and Monitoring Division (RMP) tracks management's actions and responses to determine the implementation status and required follow-up. The implementation status categories are the same as those used in previous reports:
 - **Implemented:** Action completed by 31 December 2013.
 - **Outstanding:** Action not completed by 31 December 2013.
 - **Not applicable:** Action not implemented because of changing circumstances or contexts.

EVALUATIONS PRESENTED TO THE BOARD

4. Since 2008, 68 evaluation reports with management responses have been presented to the Board.¹ The evaluation categories established by the Office of Evaluation (OEV) comprise:
 - operation evaluations;
 - country portfolio evaluations;
 - strategic and policy evaluations; and
 - impact evaluations.
5. Of the 68 evaluation reports, 31 percent were operation evaluations (21), 28 percent strategic and policy evaluations (19), 25 percent country portfolio evaluations (17), and 16 percent impact evaluations (11).
6. Over the last six years, 26 percent of the actions contained in evaluation recommendations pertain to operation evaluations, 26 percent to strategic evaluations, 31 percent to country portfolio evaluations, and 17 percent to impact evaluations (Table 1).

¹ In 2008, the Secretariat prepared management responses to the recommendations in strategic evaluation reports only; since 2009, all evaluation reports presented to the Board are accompanied by management responses.

TABLE 1: NUMBER OF EVALUATION REPORTS SUBMITTED TO THE BOARD AND PERCENTAGE OF RECOMMENDED ACTIONS, BY TYPE OF EVALUATION (2008–2013)

Type	2008		2009		2010		2011		2012		2013		TOTAL	
	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions
Operations	n/a	-	9	65	10	68	1	10	1	3	-	-	21	26
Strategic and policy	4	100	2	27	2	6	4	28	6	34	1	10	19	26
Country portfolio	n/a	-	2	8	2	20	5	40	3	40	5	51	17	31
Impact	n/a	-	n/a	-	1	6	3	21	2	23	5	39	11	17
TOTAL	4	100	13	100	15	100	13	100	11	100	11	100	68	100

QUANTITY AND GEOGRAPHICAL DISTRIBUTION OF RECOMMENDATIONS

7. Since 2008, OEV has issued 562 recommendations in 68 evaluation reports. The number of recommendations made each year increased from 57 in 2008 to 154 in 2010, falling to 78 in 2012 and 70 in 2013. The average number of recommendations per evaluation decreased from ten in 2008 to eight in 2013.
8. In response to all the recommendations issued from 2008 to 2013, management agreed to implement 917 actions, of which 172 are from 2013. Most actions – 68 percent – are for field offices, and 32 percent for Headquarters. Since 2008, management has agreed to implement an average of 15 actions per evaluation.

TABLE 2: NUMBERS OF ACTIONS BY REGION AND AS PERCENTAGES OF ALL ACTIONS (2008–2013)

Region	2008		2009		2010		2011		2012		2013		TOTAL	
	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions	No.	% of actions
Asia	-	-	13	9	75	36	30	16	36	19	40	21	194	19
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	-	-	-	-	34	16	16	8	-	-	46	25	69	10
West Africa	-	-	18	12	22	10	44	23	-	-	27	14	111	11
Southern Africa	-	-	40	27	-	-	-	-	19	10	17	9	76	8
East and Central Africa	-	-	-	-	34	16	56	29	53	27	-	-	143	14
Latin America and the Caribbean	-	-	18	12	28	13	10	5	-	-	-	-	56	6
Headquarters	69	100	58	40	18	9	36	19	84	44	57	31	322	32
TOTAL	69	100	147	100	211	100	192	100	192	100	187	100	998	100

9. The geographical breakdown in Table 2² indicates that Headquarters has the highest number of actions overall.

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ACTIONS FROM 2008 TO 2013

10. The following analysis covers 732 actions from 49 evaluation reports.³ Of these, 550 actions were either implemented or no longer applicable at 31 December 2013:
- 499 were implemented by 31 December 2013 (68 percent);
 - 51 are deemed not applicable (7 percent); and
 - 182 are outstanding (25 percent).
11. Of the 732 actions, 615 were due by 31 December 2013; this was considered the implementation target for 2013. The annual target may include actions that are no longer considered applicable (see Annexes I and II for a breakdown of actions considered not applicable). Of the 615 actions, 483 have been implemented (Table 3).

TABLE 3: IMPLEMENTATION RATES (2011–2013)			
	Number of actions implemented	Target	Implementation rate (%)
2011	339	426	80
2012	421	535	79
2013	483	615	79

12. Implementation rates were high for all types of evaluation (Table 4): 88 percent of all agreed actions from operation evaluations were implemented by the end of 2013; the equivalent figure for strategic and policy evaluations was 81 percent; and country portfolio and impact evaluations both achieved 74 percent. These figures reflect the greater complexity of implementing actions stemming from strategic and impact evaluations; by definition, impact evaluations imply deeper and broader recommendations with a longer perspective. Timelines for implementing actions stemming from these recommendations tend to underestimate the external factors that affect implementation.

² Table 2 covers all 998 actions – irrespective of end dates – from the 68 evaluations approved by the Executive Board prior to 31 December 2013. Some actions may have been reattributed because of changes in units' responsibilities, or country office realignment with regional bureaux.

³ The 19 evaluation reports – with 266 actions – closed during 2010–2012 are excluded from the analysis because actions contained in their management responses have either been implemented or are deemed not applicable.

TABLE 4: IMPLEMENTATION RATES BY TYPE OF EVALUATION (2008–2013)			
Type	Number of actions implemented	2013 target	Implementation rate (%)
Operations	84	96	88
Strategic and policy	153	188	81
Country portfolio	145	195	74
Impact	101	136	74
TOTAL	483	615	79

13. The three highest implementation rates in Table 5 are for Southern Africa, with 92 percent of the 26 actions due at 31 December 2013 implemented; East and Central Africa, with 90 percent of 115 actions implemented; and Latin America and the Caribbean, with 90 percent of 10 actions implemented. The implementation rate for Headquarters is lower than the average for country offices and regional bureaux; Annex II shows implementation rates by entity.

TABLE 5: IMPLEMENTATION RATES BY REGION (2008–2013)			
Region	Number of actions implemented	2013 target	Implementation rate (%)
Asia	79	110	72
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	30	51	59
West Africa	70	89	79
Southern Africa	24	26	92
East and Central Africa	104	115	90
Latin America and the Caribbean	9	10	90
Headquarters	167	214	78
TOTAL	483	615	79

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

14. From 2008 to 2013, 79 percent of the actions with a deadline of 31 December 2013 from 49 evaluation reports were implemented; 84 actions remain pending. While this is a higher implementation rate than that of comparable organizations,⁴ WFP is committed to increasing it for 2014. Each action has a timeline; managers are held accountable for taking action; and WFP tracks the implementation of evaluation recommendations continuously, reporting on performance in achieving targets in its Annual Performance Report.

⁴ The United Nations Secretariat Report on the Activities of the Office of Internal Oversight Services for the period from 1 July 2012 to 30 June 2013 – Addendum, 19 August 2012 (A/68/337 (Part I)/Add.1) states that at 31 December 2012, programme managers of the United Nations Secretariat had implemented 62 percent of all the recommendations issued during the calendar year. Internal audit recommendations are included in this figure.

ANNEX I

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS AT 31 DECEMBER 2013				
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding actions (%)	Not applicable (%)
Peer Review of the Evaluation Function at the World Food Programme (WFP/EB.1/2008/7-A/Add.1)	34	79	3	18
Evaluation of WFP's Capacity Development Policy and Operations (WFP/EB.A/2008/7/Add.1)	12	100	0	0
End-of-Term Evaluation of WFP's Gender Policy (2003–2007): Enhanced Commitments to Women to Ensure Food Security (WFP/EB.2/2008/6-B/Add.1)	9	89	11	0
Burkina Faso Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation 105410 (WFP/EB.A/2009/7-E/Add.1)	6	83	0	17
Côte d'Ivoire Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation 106720 (WFP/EB.2/2009/6-C/Add.1)	9	56	0	44
Afghanistan Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation 104270 (WFP/EB.1/2010/7-A/Add.1)	32	97	0	3
Joint Thematic Evaluation of FAO and WFP Support to Information Systems for Food Security (WFP/EB.1/2010/7-B/Add.1)	9	78	22	0
Egypt Country Programme 104500 (2007–2011) (WFP/EB.A/2010/7-B/Add.1)	9	67	0	33
School Feeding Programmes in Kenya (1999–2008) (WFP/EB.A/2010/7-D/Add.1)	12	92	8	0
Annual Evaluation Report 2009 (WFP/EB.A/2010/7-A/Add.1)	5	100	0	0
Chad Country Portfolio (2003-2009) (WFP/EB.2/2010/6-A/Add.1+Corr.1)	9	100	0	0
Sudan Emergency Operation 107600 (WFP/EB.2/2010/6-D/Add.1)	8	100	0	0
Ethiopia Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation 106650 (2008–2010) (WFP/EB.2/2010/6-E/Add.1)	7	100	0	0
Mali Country Portfolio (2003–2009) (WFP/EB.1/2011/6-A/Add.1)	14	100	0	0
Impact Evaluation of School Feeding in Cambodia (WFP/EB.1/2011/6-B/Add.1/Rev.1)	9	100	0	0
Impact Evaluation of School Feeding in the Gambia (WFP/EB.A/2011/7-D/Add.1)	11	64	36	0

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS AT 31 DECEMBER 2013				
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding actions (%)	Not applicable (%)
Rwanda Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.A/2011/7-E/Add.1)	14	100	0	0
Annual Evaluation Report 2010 (WFP/EB.A/2011/7-A/Add.1)	7	100	0	0
Strategic Evaluation of WFP's Role in Social Protection and Safety Nets (WFP/EB.A/2011/7-B/Add.1)	10	90	10	0
Haiti Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-C/Add.1)	11	91	0	9
Strategic Mid-Term Evaluation of WFP's Agriculture and Market Support in Uganda (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-A/Add.1)	22	82	18	0
Strategic Mid-Term Evaluation of WFP's Purchase for Progress Initiative (2008–2013) (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-B/Add.1/Rev.1 + Corr.1)	15	100	0	0
Kenya Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-D/Add.1)	20	90	5	5
Yemen Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-E/Add.1)	18	67	0	33
Impact Evaluation of School Feeding in Bangladesh (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-F/Add.1)	21	86	14	0
The Niger Emergency Operation 200170 (WFP/EB.2/2011/6-G/Add.1)	20	90	0	10
Strategic Evaluation – From Food Aid to Food Assistance: Working in Partnership (WFP/EB.1/2012/6-A/Add.1)	18	78	22	0
Joint UNHCR/WFP Impact Evaluation on the Contribution of Food Assistance to Durable Solutions in Protracted Refugee Situations – Ethiopia (WFP/EB.1/2012/6-E/Add.1)	33	73	6	21
WFP School Feeding Policy (WFP/EB.1/2012/6-D/Add.1)	16	100	0	0
Strategic Evaluation of WFP's Role in Ending Long-Term Hunger (WFP/EB.1/2012/6-C/Add.1)	12	50	50	0
Strategic Evaluation on How WFP's Country Offices Adapt to Change (WFP/EB.1/2012/6-B/Add.1/Rev.1)	7	57	43	0
Annual Evaluation Report 2011 (WFP/EB.A/2012/7-A/Add.1/Corr.1)	10	30	70	0
Zimbabwe Country Portfolio (2006–2010) (WFP/EB.A/2012/7-B/Add.1)	19	100	0	0
Afghanistan Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.2/2012/6-D/Add.1)	36	47	47	6

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS AT 31 DECEMBER 2013				
Management response document	Actions (number)	Implemented actions (%)	Outstanding actions (%)	Not applicable (%)
Somalia Country Portfolio (WFP/EB.2/2012/6-C/Add.1)	21	62	38	0
WFP's Private-Sector Partnership and Fundraising Strategy (WFP/EB.2/2012/6-A/Add.1)	2	0	100	0
Global Logistics Cluster (WFP/EB.2/2012/6-B/Add.1)	6	83	17	0
Joint UNHCR/WFP Impact Evaluation on the Contribution of Food Assistance to Durable Solutions in Protracted Refugee Situations – Rwanda (WFP/EB.2/2012/6-E/Add.1)	12	83	0	17
Joint UNHCR/WFP Impact Evaluation on the Contribution of Food Assistance to Durable Solutions in Protracted Refugee Situations – Bangladesh (WFP/EB.1/2013/6-B/Add.1)	4	50	0	50
Joint UNHCR/WFP Impact Evaluation on the Contribution of Food Assistance to Durable Solutions in Protracted Refugee Situations – Chad (WFP/EB.1/2013/6-A/Add.1)	30	57	30	13
Synthesis of the Joint UNHCR/WFP Impact Evaluations on the Contribution of Food Assistance to Durable Solutions in Protracted Refugee Situations (WFP/EB.1/2013/6-C/Add.1)	10	10	90	0
Annual Evaluation Report 2012 (WFP/EB.A/2013/7-A/Add.1)	18	39	61	0
The Kyrgyz Republic Country Portfolio (2008–2012) (WFP/EB.A/2013/7-B/Add.1)	22	18	82	0
The Niger Country Portfolio (2007–2011) (WFP/EB.A/2013/7-C/Add.1)	10	70	30	0
Timor-Leste Country Portfolio (2008–2012) (WFP/EB.A/2013/7-D/Add.1)	19	42	11	47
The Impact of Food for Assets on Livelihood Resilience in Bangladesh (2008–2011) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-A/Add.1)	15	7	93	0
The Impact of Food for Assets on Livelihood Resilience in Nepal (2002–2010) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-B/Add.1/Rev.1)	15	7	93	0
The Sudan Country Portfolio (2010–2012) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-C/Add.1)	27	19	81	0
The Congo Country Portfolio (2009–2012) (WFP/EB.2/2013/6-D/Add.1)	17	29	71	0
TOTAL	732	68	25	7

ANNEX II

IMPLEMENTATION STATUS OF ALL ACTIONS DUE BY 31 DECEMBER 2013 BY ENTITY				
ENTITY	Total actions	Implemented actions	Outstanding actions	Not applicable
Asia	110	79	20	11
Country Office Afghanistan	66	47	16	3
Country Office Bangladesh	27	21	4	2
Country Office Cambodia	9	9	0	0
Country Office Nepal	1	1	0	0
Country Office Timor-Leste	7	1	0	6
Middle East, North Africa, Eastern Europe and Central Asia	51	30	12	9
Country Office Egypt	8	5	0	3
Country Office the Kyrgyz Republic	4	1	3	0
Country Office the Sudan	22	13	9	0
Country Office Yemen	16	10	0	6
Cairo Regional Bureau	1	1	0	0
West Africa	89	70	13	6
Country Office Burkina Faso	3	3	0	0
Country Office Chad	27	18	9	0
Country Office Côte d'Ivoire	9	5	0	4
Country Office Mali	14	14	0	0
Country Office the Gambia	11	7	4	0
Country Office the Niger	25	23	0	2
Southern Africa	26	24	2	0
Country Office the Congo	7	5	2	0
Country Office Zimbabwe	19	19	0	0
East and Central Africa	115	104	9	2
Country Office Ethiopia	30	28	2	0
Country Office Kenya	31	28	2	1
Country Office Rwanda	24	23	0	1
Country Office Somalia	8	7	1	0
Country Office Uganda	22	18	4	0
Latin America and the Caribbean	10	9	0	1
Country Office Haiti	10	9	0	1
Headquarters	214	167	28	19
TOTAL	615	483	84	48